7-1-2010

Nuances In A Panethnic Southwest Landscape

Angelica Solares

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/arch_etds

Part of the Architecture Commons

Recommended Citation

Angelica Solares

Candidate

Community and Regional Planning

Department

This thesis is approved, and it is acceptable in quality and form for publication:

Approved by the Thesis Committee:

[Signatures]

Chairperson
NUANCES IN A PANETHNIC SOUTHWEST LANDSCAPE

BY

ANGELICA SOLARES

BACHELOR OF ENVIRONMENTAL DESIGN

THESIS

Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Community and Regional Planning

The University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, New Mexico

July, 2010
©2010, Angelica Solares
Acknowledgments

I am extremely thankful to my family Daniel, Karinna and Victoria for their continuous encouragement and extraordinary patience. I owe the virtue of having completed this thesis to them, especially my daughters who unselfishly gave up many hours of mommy time.

I would like to thank Dr. Claudia Isaac; my committee chair for her guidance, knowledge and for her total support thought this process. Most importantly, I am grateful for her continuous challenge of my thought process.

I also thank Dr. Timothy Imeopkaria and Moises Gonzales for their advice, support and insight regarding the physical components of this work.

Special thanks to my parents Enrique and Josefina who crossed the border to give our family better life. Their example of perseverance and pride of where we come from is the reason I am where I am today, and the inspiration for this thesis.
NUANCES IN A PANETHNIC SOUTHWEST LANDSCAPE

BY

ANGELICA SOLARES

ABSTRACT OF THESIS
Submitted in Partial Fulfillment of the
Requirements for the Degree of

Master of Community and Regional Planning

The University of New Mexico
Albuquerque, New Mexico

July, 2010
ABSTRACT

Urban landscapes of places with large immigrant populations are transformed as immigrants bring a different use of space with them. Mexican immigrants throughout the southwestern United States have physically transformed the landscape, and these transformed places often result in spaces that foster socialization and assert cultural identity. This thesis proposes that a three-stage cycle of spatial production exists in Mexicano communities in the United States, and describes the author’s three-stage cycle of spatial production model in detail. The cycle begins with the formation of an enclave, followed by the transformation of the urban landscape which then results in one of two outcomes 1) inevitable displacement or 2) empowerment.

Using case studies based in California, Arizona and Texas, as a way to test the model, this thesis explores how the three-stage cycle begins, how Mexican cultural identity contributes to the physical transformation of the urban landscape, and the outcomes of those physical transformations. Because Albuquerque’s New Mexican landscape, distinguishable by Pueblo and Territorial style architecture has been altered by the presence of Mexicanos in the city, it provides an opportunity to conduct a comparative analysis. The Zuni area in Albuquerque is used as the site in which to conduct the comparative analysis. It demonstrates that it has completed stages I and II of the three-stage cycle of spatial production and it is moving toward stage III. The comparative analysis also highlights that stage III of the cycle has potential for displacement as a final outcome. Ultimately, the model serves as a tool to evaluate a community that is in the process of, or could be in the process of redevelopment or re-investment. Recommendations are provided to help maintain the cultural identity of Mexicano communities in order to avoid displacement.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>vi</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>ix</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Tables</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>List of Maps</td>
<td>x</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface</td>
<td>xi</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 1

I. Introduction ..........................1
   • Discussion of chapter content ..........3
   • Theoretical Base ........................4
      1. Transformation of the urban landscape ....5
      2. Translation of identity to landscape ....13

## Chapter 2

I. Methodology ............................17

## Chapter 3

Three-Stage cycle of spatial production

   • Introduction ...........................23
      1. Formation ............................25
      2. Transformation ........................25
      3. Displacement/empowerment ...............31
Chapter 4
Comparative Studies

- Overview .................................................35
  1. El Mercado de Los Ángeles, CA .........................36
  2. South Street, El Paso, TX ............................39
  3. Palomino neighborhood, AZ ..........................41

- Three-stage cycle of spatial production
  1. El Mercado de los Ángeles, CA .........................43
  2. South Street, El Paso, TX ............................50
  3. Palomino neighborhood, AZ ..........................58

Chapter 5
Comparative Case Study: Albuquerque’s Zuni area

I. Background .............................................65
II. Three-stage cycle of spatial production: Zuni area ...............66
III. Analysis
  - Where is the Zuni area on the three-stage-cycle of production? ...........77

Chapter 6

I. Conclusions
  - Government intervention
    Near Heights MRA expansion plan
      a. Displacement in the horizon ..........................78

II. Recommendations .....................................80

Bibliography .............................................82
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Figure</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Figure 1.1</td>
<td>The concentric zone model</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.1</td>
<td>Three–stage cycle abstract diagram</td>
<td>23</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.2</td>
<td>Three-stage cycle model</td>
<td>24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.3</td>
<td>Birrieria façade, Los Ángeles, CA</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.4</td>
<td>Mural by Orozco, Guadalajara, Jalisco, MX</td>
<td>28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 3.5</td>
<td>Pro Ranch Market, Phoenix, AZ</td>
<td>31</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.1</td>
<td>El Mercado de Los Ángeles, CA Example of Spanish signage</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.2</td>
<td>Iconography in El Mercado de Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.3</td>
<td>Mural, Boyle Heights, CA</td>
<td>45</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.4</td>
<td>Boyle Heights, El Mercado Roofed vendor structure</td>
<td>47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.5</td>
<td>South El Paso Street, El Paso, TX Example of Spanish signage</td>
<td>53</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.6</td>
<td>South El Paso Street, El Paso, TX Sidewalk used as linear plaza</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.7</td>
<td>South El Paso Street Mural</td>
<td>54</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.8</td>
<td>South El Paso Street Iconography</td>
<td>55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.9</td>
<td>Spanish signage in the Palomino neighborhood</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.10</td>
<td>Iconography in the Palomino neighborhood</td>
<td>60</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 4.11</td>
<td>Macehualli Day Labor Center</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Figure 5.1</td>
<td>Iconography, Abq</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
LIST OF TABLES

Table 1  Case study site visit #1 ........................................18
Table 2  Case study site visit #2 ........................................19
Table 3  Analytical tool (checklist) ....................................20
Table 4  Phases/Markers Matrix ........................................22
Table 5  Mexicano-born residents in Albuquerque ..........71
Table 6  Albuquerque checklist ........................................78

LIST OF MAPS

Map 1  Boyle Heights boundary map ..............................39
Map 2  South El Paso Street ........................................42
Map 3  Palomino neighborhood “the square” ..................43
Map 4  Barrio Chihuahuita, El Paso TX .........................53
Map 5  Mexicano-born residents >40% .........................69
Map 6  International District ........................................74
PREFACE

The idea that a three-stage cycle of production exists in Mexicano communities in the United States grew out of my past experiences and observations in cities as a Mexicana living in the United States. During the nearly two decades that I have lived in the United States, I have experienced particular places go through cycles of transformation. Most recently while visiting southern California, I noticed that the city, which was once my home looked and felt different.

There was a time while I resided in Santa Ana, California that I was able to take a leisurely walk down Fourth Street and reminisce on what life in Mexico used to be for me. Fourth Street was one of those streets lined with a large array of Mexican shops, offering a large and diverse range of retail and service activities where Mexicanos like me could find anything we were missing from our homeland.

In the particular case of Santa Ana, in 2008 when I returned after a 5 year absence, I was surprised to find that the distinctive characteristics that drew Mexicans into the space were gone. Walking down the street, I noticed that a transformation of the place had happened. Street vendors selling fruit and miscellaneous items were no longer roaming the street as they had done before. Now, four vendors who seemed to be strategically placed alongside the entire length of the street took their place. These vendors were wearing matching color attires; their carts were all the same – stainless steel with a maroon umbrella, and selling the same items. Advertisement of their for sale items was displayed on a plexiglass surface attached to their carts in a uniform yellow appliqué of
similar font. The ubiquitous loud banda \(^1\) music that had filled the street was muted, as I kept walking down the street I felt what seemed to be the acts of an invisible hand trying to tidy up the street. Facades were plain and ordinary looking, the bold colors that brought life to the street front were now subdued, yet you still had a sense that this was a “Mexican” space despite the faux ambiance.

It was this type of transformation that motivated me to inquire more deeply into explicitly Mexican places in the Southwestern United States. I began to trace these transformations of space using personal memory. Reflection on my past experience of spaces and observations of what these spaces are like now helped me to formulate the idea that what I was looking at was indeed production of space.

\(^1\) Banda music is a genre of Mexican music that originated in the northwestern states of Mexico. During the 1990’s banda music gained popularity throughout the rest of Mexico. Banda music is characterized by brass, woodwind, and percussion instruments most notably the tambora.
Chapter 1

I. Introduction

This thesis brings forth the notion that a three-stage cycle of production exists in Mexican communities in cities in the United States. Urban landscapes of places with large immigrant populations are transformed as immigrants bring with them a different use of space. The transformation of the physical landscape often results in spaces that foster socialization, and here in the United States, the Mexican Diaspora is transforming the physical environment. This thesis looks at how places are physically transformed by Mexicanos in California, Arizona, Texas and New Mexico and how those transformed places have resulted in places that Mexicanos use for socializing.

I chose this topic for three reasons: 1) I want to see how members of the Mexican Diaspora living in the United States transform existing urban spaces; 2) I want to know whether their cultural identity is embedded in the physical environments they transform and 3) I want to know if the resulting transformed landscape affords them an opportunity for socializing and place-making.

New Mexico is characterized by its Hispanic influence and often Mexicanos are placed in the homogenous Hispanic group, but Albuquerque landscapes remind us of Mexicano-New Mexican differences regardless of panethnicity.

My inclination to do research in the Mexican community in Albuquerque came from my subject position as a Mexican immigrant in this city. I also chose Albuquerque

---

2 Persons of Mexican ancestry residing in the United States represent a diverse group that includes recent immigrants, children or grandchildren of immigrants, and the descendents of Mexicans living in the Southwest when the land was taken from Mexico. Persons of Mexican-origin in the United States may adopt an array of racial/ethnic labels including Mexican, Mexicano/a, Mexican American, Chicano/a, Hispanic or Latino/a. For the purpose of this thesis I use the term Mexicano/a to refer to recently arrived Mexican immigrants and those persons of Mexican origin living in the United States, not considered Chicanos, Hispanics or Latinos.
for a comparative analysis with other southwest cities because of the interesting dynamics of race and identity unique to New Mexico. The dynamics between New Mexicans and Mexicanos are often those of contestation and therefore it is important to recognize the uniqueness of Mexican identity in New Mexico to better appreciate the existence of places transformed by Mexicanos.

This research on the transformation of the urban landscape is of particular importance to Albuquerque because Mexicanos in the city continue to make their presence known through physical transformation of the spaces they inhabit. The research asserts that Mexicanos have a cultural inclination for social interaction and seek public spaces in their new environments to do so. When spaces are not available they tend to create them by transforming their new environment. Given that Mexicanos mold the urban landscape to meet their social needs, people can appreciate the uniqueness of their culture expressed in the physical environment. By molding their new environment Mexicanos are not only establishing a territorial presence and creating a space for social interaction but also acquiring a sense of belonging in their host environment.

Focusing on the social interactions of Mexicanos that happen in spaces transformed, I use the concept of the production of space introduced by Henry Lefebvre (1995) to address the transformation of space. Lefebvre argues that space is not an inert, neutral, or a pre-existing given, but rather, an on-going production of spatial relations. From that point of departure I further examine neighborhood change using Duncan and Duncan’s invasion-succession model derived from the concentric zone model of demographic change (Duncan & Duncan, 1957). In this thesis I adapt these two theories to produce a

---

three-stage-cycle of spatial production and argue that this three-stage-cycle of production exists in Mexicano communities in U.S cities. I use a case study approach to illustrate how this cycle of socio-spatial production by Mexicanos has taken place in other cities of the southwestern United States. Based on the information gathered through the case studies, I then conduct a comparative analysis of Albuquerque using the three-stage cycle model and answer the following question: Where is Albuquerque in the three-stage-cycle of production?

II. Discussion of chapter contents

This thesis is organized into six chapters that contain the introduction of the research and literature review, methodology, introduction of the three-stage cycle of production, case study data and analysis, comparative analysis and findings and a conclusion and recommendations section.

Chapter one foregrounds the thesis’ primary queries and theoretical framework, articulates the objectives of this research. The literature review lays out the theoretical framework that informs this research and focuses on the transformation of the urban landscape and the relationship of cultural identity to the landscape.

Chapter two describes the methods used, why they were chosen, and explains the approach for the analysis.

Chapter three outlines how this research builds on the theory of social and spatial practice, ethnic identity and human geography scholarship discussed in chapter one and introduces the author’s three-stage cycle of spatial production model which is this thesis’ focus.
Chapter four presents the case studies. The three-stage cycle of production of space is outlined for each case study; data is provided and analyzed in this section.

Chapter five compares Albuquerque to the three case study sites. Albuquerque as a comparative site is first described in the background followed by a description of how the three-stage cycle of production manifests in Albuquerque. Analysis of Albuquerque as a case study answers the research question *where is Albuquerque on the three-stage-cycle model?* The answer to this question has some planning implications which are discussed in chapter six.

Chapter six concludes with insights about how this document informs planners and policy makers and presents recommendations for an alternate outcome of the final stage of the model.

III. **Theoretical Base**

The theoretical framework that informs this research comes from literature in the fields of social and spatial practices, ethnic identity and human geography. Theories on the production of space and ethnic identity have helped me query how the transformation of the urban landscape by Mexicanos has created Mexican explicit and culturally significant spaces for socializing in U.S cities. The following questions shaped the framework for my case studies:

1. How does Mexicano identity affect the landscape?
2. Why do Mexicanos feel the need to transform the urban landscape?
3. In what ways are Mexican immigrants able to transform the urban landscape as opposed to other immigrant groups?
4. What are the conditions that allow for this transformation?
5. Is the three-stage cycle of production seen broadly in cities experiencing Mexican immigration?

The query on the transformation of the urban landscape is important for planning practice, especially in New Mexico where New Mexican/Mexicano dynamics are often those of contestation. Landscapes in Albuquerque that do not conform to the existing territorial architectural style of the city assert the presence of the Mexican Diaspora in Albuquerque and remind its citizens of our differences regardless of panethnicity. It is for this reason; I first wanted to see how members of the Mexican Diaspora living in the Southwestern United States are transforming existing urban spaces and second, I wanted to further investigate how Mexicano cultural identity is embedded into the physical environment resulting in a transformed landscape that affords an opportunity for place-making.

1. Transformation of the Urban Landscape

i. Understanding Space

In order to better understand the transformation of the urban landscape it is important to define space. Choosing the right definition of space for this thesis is important as it will influence the way Mexican appropriation of space is analyzed.

For decades geographers and others have understood and defined space in absolute terms. In this absolute view, space was seen as a system of organization and Euclidean geometry within which objects are located and events occur (Curry, 1995 and Gleeson, 1996). Understanding the geometrical essence of space is without doubt important,

---

but it is also very important to take into account the interrelationship of people and space. Space as explained by the location theory⁵ and Marxist geography literature can be both-a physical arrangement of the built environment and a product of the interrelationship of people and their environment. For the purpose of this thesis I define space as a socially produced arrangement of the built environment, one that is constantly being created. In this instance, certain spaces within the U.S. urban environment are continuously produced by the relation Mexicanos have with the environment.

**Henri Lefebvre**

In his work *The Production of Space* Henri Lefebvre outlines a framework to understand space as a product of social production. Lefebvre developed the thesis that “social space works as a tool for the analysis of society” (LeFebvre, 1995, p34). The idea that we could understand society by interrogating space was a radical concept at that time, as it challenged the concept of space as passive and established an understanding of space as both an active (constantly being created) process and product. Lefebvre details how the production of space is premised on three complementary levels: spatial practices, representation of space and spaces of representation. These three levels provide us with a model to investigate how social-spatiality is created.

*Spatial Practices (perceived space)*

Lefebvre explains spatial practices as concrete processes of our daily spatial routines. In relation to urban space, for example, it is these spatial practices that serve to produce and reproduce the city. Our understanding of space is shaped by our spatial practices, how we experience space by inhabiting it and our spatial daily routines. This is also the process by which physical space is produced. Lefebvre uses ‘spatial practices’ as

⁵ The spatial expression of which is frequently discussed in Euclidean terms.
a tool to designate how gestures construct space as life is lived, and defines space as patterns of everyday life (Liggett, 2003, p83). For example, the experience of a recently arrived Mexican to Albuquerque is different than anyone else in the city. His/her experience might be initially shaped by the constraints of his/her legal status and accessibility to a car. His/her social practices depend upon the ability to get around by foot, or use public transportation, which may limit the experience of Albuquerque to a very specific geographic area within the city, it is within the limits of this constraint that physical space is created or adapted to cater to his/her specific needs.

**Representation of Space (conceived space)**

Representations of space are the abstract forms that serve to represent and make sense of space. Lefebvre argues that ‘representations of space’ are often a product of planning and related design professions that construct space, often without maintaining contact with spatial practices. Maps, plans, surveys, zoning codes, and so on can be representations of space; as these documents organize knowledge of space. Although representations of space operate abstractly they impose meaning on space. For example, Albuquerque’s Nob Hill sector plan is a local example of representation of space. A sector plan provides general guidelines directed towards ensuring the orderly and efficient development of a plan area. It addresses essential services, facilities, land uses, density and character. Nob Hill’s sector plan seeks to ensure that this mile-long stretch of Central Avenue remains a vibrant district bursting with unique shops, trendy restaurants and chic nightspots committed to the area’s retro style.

Nob Hill’s sector plan is similar in structure to several other sector plans adopted by the city, but it imposes a meaning on space privileging some spatial practices and ex-
cluding, even criminalizing others. Nob Hill’s trendy corridor abutted by mixed-use development is located just east of the University of New Mexico. Nob Hill is physically characterized by art-deco and middle of the century architecture and is demarcated by Route 66 neon arches at each of its boundaries.

**Spaces of Representation (lived space)**

Spaces of representation are those spaces that have symbolic meaning embedded in their spatial form. These are the spaces that are directly lived, occupied and transformed by inhabiting them (Cenzatti, 2008). The local fair grounds on Louisiana Avenue and Central Avenue in Albuquerque, New Mexico are an example of spaces of representation. The physical space of the fairgrounds does not change when it is occupied by the swap meet on Saturdays or Sundays, the New Mexico State Fair in early fall, or the homebuilders trade show. Nonetheless, the social relations that take place on those given instances produce different ‘lived moments’ or different spaces of representation. Cenzatti (2008) further explains that the characteristics of the physical space give shape and even impose limits on what kinds of spaces of representation can be produced there.

**ii. Barrioization vs. Barriology**

During the early decades of the twentieth century waves of Mexican immigrants arrived in the southwestern part of the United States. As more Mexicanos arrived and experienced segregation in parts of the city, immigrants moved to less desirable areas, thus forming the original barrios\(^6\). Although not a phenomenon unique to Mexicanos,

---

\(^6\) Spanish word for neighborhoods. In the United States this word is mainly used to describe an area within a city characterized by Spanish-speaking residents of lower socio-economic status.
this concentration of immigrants in particular areas is useful in understanding the transformation of the urban landscape.

According to Herzog (2004), the *barrioization* and *barriology* paradigms have been traditionally used to explain barrio landscapes in Mexican/Latino communities in the United States. Barrioization, a term coined by Camarillo in 1979\(^7\) explains the formation of barrios as Mexicanos/Latinos of lesser socio-economic status stake out a territory which is overwhelmed by urban diseconomies-poverty, crime, negative land uses and so on (Herzog, 2004). Villa (2000) expanded on this term “as a complex of dominating social processes originating outside of the barrios”; Herzog (2004) further explains this as “the process by which Latinos began to reassert control over their neighborhoods through acquisition of political power, mastery of the process of urban planning, and the use of art and muralism to create identity” (Herzog, 2004, p103).

In Herzog’s view, barrioization is the product of two forces; on the one hand, migration, whereby, large numbers of Mexicans migrate to the United States in search of work, and on the other the economy, which forced them to locate where the rents were cheaper. In addition, it is important to recognize that Mexican migrants concentrate in certain parts of cities not only because of cheap rents but also because they are following their social networks. These networks consist of kin, friendship and *paisanaje*\(^8\) relations that link particular groups of Mexicanos to specific destinations in the United States and then, in turn, that draw migrants toward settlement in these new cities. These networks are, thus also a basis for the process of barrioization. Piore (1979) and Rodriguez (1993) have also recognized this phenomenon as a social process of migration. It is this conti-

---
\(^8\)This term refers to persons originating from the same country or region within a country or the sharing of a community of origin.
nual social process of migration that draws immigrants to certain parts of the city where
kin or friends already live that help to develop barrios.

Herzog further explains that barriology begins with the creation of symbolic ac-
tivities such as parades, holiday festivities, and cultural events and was a response to
mass deportation and the great depression of the 1930s. Recall Lefebvre’s explanation
that these activities or spatial practices serve to assert and appropriate representational
space. In the barrios, murals became a kind of collective decision and a way to Mexican-
ize the bland spaces that had become hope to the Chicano population. Examples of barri-
ology are the murals painted to transform unsightly spaces into powerful expressions of
Mexican-American identity.

iii. Invasion-Succession Model

Burgess (1925) developed a model, called the Concentric Zone Model (Figure
1.1, page 11), to depict the use of urban land in the city of Chicago during the 1920’s and
1930’s as a set of concentric rings with each ring devoted to a different land use.9

---

9 In 1925, Ernest Burgess, a member of the University of Chicago Sociology department presented a de-
scriptive urban land use model, which divided cities in a set of concentric circles expanding from the down-
town to the suburbs. This representation was built from Burgess' observations of a number of American
cities, notably Chicago, for which he provided empirical evidence. The model assumes a relationship be-
tween the socio-economic status (mainly income) of households and the distance from the Central Business
District (CBD). According to this model better housing is located furthest from the CBD,
but the commuting time is also longer. Thus, accessing better housing is done at the expense of longer
commuting times (and costs). According to this monocentric model (see above figure), a large city is di-
vided in six concentric zones.
The invasion-succession model derives from the Concentric Zone Model. The invasion-succession model describes changes in spatial patterns of residential areas within concentric zones using human ecology, as compared to plant succession. The concept was drawn from the field of biological ecology where the terms *invasion* and *succession* were taken to describe common processes in neighborhood change. In biological ecology, different populations of flora and/or fauna have a propensity to remain separate; the invasion-succession process begins when a new type of plant invades a new habitat. Invasion happens when the new plant moves into the area of a second, if the original plant population is successful in keeping the new population out, succession has been stopped, but if the new plant takes over, succession has happened. This same concept was used to analyze the spatial patterns where each group of people had its niche in the city (Knox, 1994) and neighborhood change was taking place. Invasion is the process where new populations move into an already established neighborhood, resulting in succession where the original population is unable to keep the new population out, displacing most of the original population. The invasion-succession model was mainly used to analyze residential
areas taken over by commercial land uses or vice versa. Although the model works only for cities similar in structure to Chicago [in the 30’s and 40’s], with a dominant economic core and a rapidly growing metropolitan area, its basic structure allows for flexibility and can help illustrate how ethnic minorities transform urban landscapes.

Duncan and Duncan (1957) expanded on the invasion/succession model and argued that the model happened in four stages: penetration, invasion, consolidation and piling up, although some neighborhoods do not go through all four stages. Penetration is when residents of another race move into a neighborhood. They are usually the same class as the current residents with the same income range and same types of jobs. In the second stage (invasion) a substantial number of members of another race and class move into a neighborhood. The next stage, consolidation, is the continued increase in number of the new residents after invasion has taken place. Newly arrived Mexicano/a immigrants moving into areas of a city where other Mexicano/a immigrants live is an example of consolidation. This stage may continue until the neighborhood is full of new residents, and the final stage, piling up, begins. During the piling up stage, the neighborhood’s population density continues to rise as no new housing is built, but the number of persons living there rises. It is important to highlight that Duncan and Duncan’s model only focuses on economic reasons for succession and does not permit for cultural factors to be a part of the decision for people to relocate where they do (Knox, 1994). Here too, the basic structure of Duncan and Duncan’s four stages within the invasion-succession model allows for flexibility and helps illustrate the transformation of the landscape by the Mexican Diaspora. Further examination of cultural factors is needed to understand the physical transformation of space.
2. Translation of identity to landscape

   i. Mexican Vernacular

   Since space can be a product of the interrelationship of people and the environment, the vernacular plays an important role in the transformation of the urban landscape. In this thesis, the word vernacular is not used in strict architectural terms but rather as a set of local practices that take shape outside planning, design, zoning, regulation, and covenants as defined by Kirshenblatt-Gimblett (1999). These local practices are further explained as the process of what ordinary people do in their everyday lives. Kirshenblatt-Gimblett’s explanation of the vernacular and Lefebvre’s explanation of the spatial practices are very similar and complementary. Understanding Lefebvre’s spatial practices and Kirshenblatt-Gimblett’s vernacular allows me to build on both of these concepts and relate them to this thesis as the concept of the Mexican vernacular. Teasing away at both of these definitions and reflecting on my own cultural experience helped me to begin to draw upon important elements in Mexican culture such as rituals and customs that result in social interactions that are then expressed spatially in the urban landscape. Understanding the uniqueness of Mexican history, culture, social customs and regionalism helps to better explain the transformation and production of space by Mexicanos/as in U.S cities. For instance, social historian Charles Flaudrau (1964) acknowledges the importance of plazas and parks as spaces of social interaction in Mexico. In Mexico, the plaza is a culturally significant open space has roots in both pre Columbian and Colonial Mexico (Lombardo, 1988). It is not surprising that some of the significance of the plaza or other public spaces carries over to the United States when immigrants arrive in their new environment. The particular use of parks and other public spaces that facilitate so-
cial activities is an example of how Mexicanos transform the existing urban landscape to meet their spatial and social needs.

**ii. Mexicano/a Identity**

Understanding the transformation of the urban landscape by Mexicanos also requires an awareness of Mexicano/a identity, and how this identity translates to the urban landscape. I do not attempt to characterize what a Mexican is or what being Mexican means in one overarching definition, I think this task would be impossible. However, I will make an attempt to unveil Mexicano/a identity to better understand the Mexican vernacular.

Theories in ethnic identity suggest that ethnic identification is constructed on the basis of cultural socialization, physical appearance and sharing of a common history (Webber, 1961 and Phinney, 1995). It is through interaction with reference group members that people identify themselves as members of a given group and incorporates an ethnic identity (Nieman, Romero, Arredondo and Rodriguez, 1999). Keefe (1992) summarizes ethnic identity as (1) the perception of differences between ethnic groups, (2) ethnic group attachment and pride, and (3) the perception of prejudice and discrimination against one’s own ethnic group (Phinney, 1996). Further, Phinney (1996) explains that ethnic identity has psychological importance and identifies three aspects that account for it (1) cultural values, (2) subjective sense of ethnic group membership, and (3) experiences associated with minority status, which refers to struggles to gain equality, recognition, and acceptance in the larger society. The sum of all these physical, social and psychological characteristics can be applied directly to Mexican identity to illustrate its uniqueness.
Using a combination of Keefe’s and Phinney’s methods of summarizing identity, helped me to deconstruct Mexicano/a identity for this thesis focusing on the following three concepts, a) the perception of differences between ethnic groups, b) cultural attachment and pride, and c) experiences associated with minority status. These three concepts are not interdependent but rather they are overlapping.

**The perception of differences between ethnic groups**

According to Keefe (1992), perceived differences between ethnic groups include obvious things such as language and physical features. In this thesis, one indicator of the perception of differences will be the use of Spanish language by Mexicanos, although many may speak/understand English, it is also possible that English was learned as a second language and Spanish is still preferred. Many New Mexicans also are bilingual but there are clear linguistic differences between Mexican Spanish and New Mexican Spanish. In this thesis it is particularly important to recognize Spanish language because it is used in building signage in spaces that have been transformed. Cultural values are another way to distinguish ethnic differences. Keefe points out differences between Anglos and Mexicanos through a series of interviews with 24 participants. The major cultural differences ranged from behavioral styles and emotional expressions.

**Cultural attachment and Pride**

Keefe distinguishes cultural attachment and pride as an individual’s connection to cultural heritage. Expressions of Mexican cultural heritage can be the act of listening to Mexican music or one’s inclination to observe Mexican civic and religious holidays. Cul-
tural affiliation plays an important role in cultural attachment because it involves the development of emotional attachment. Keefe further explains that the process of adopting cultural traditions is important as in the generational passing of Mexican culture. An example of transformation of space via expressions of Mexican cultural heritage is seen during the Cinco de Mayo\textsuperscript{10} celebration in Albuquerque’s civic plaza.

Regional identity is also a critical variable in the process of attachment and pride. Oberle and Arreola (2008) argue that allegiance to a region is particularly strong among Mexican immigrants in a host environment because “to many Americans a Mexican is a Mexican, and no further distinction is warranted. Yet regional identity is significant in the immigration and settlement process because it allows us to understand the geographical nuance of human movement, not simply among nations but also among people and their places” (Oberle & Arreola, 2008).

\textit{Experiences associated with minority status}

Phinney (1996) points out that ethnic identity is strongly associated with one’s situation and experiences within the larger society. She further explains that ethnicity among ethnic groups of color implies experiences of prejudice and discrimination coupled with less power and status. These experiences then have psychological effects and are manifested in many ways, one of which is the tendency to emphasize collective values over individualistic ones. Consideration of these experiences is important when looking at the transformed urban environment. Manifestations of these experiences are seen in the transformed environment. Barriology is a way in which Mexicanos respond to and deal with these experiences.

\textsuperscript{10} The Fifth of May. Cinco de Mayo celebration commemorates Mexican victory over French forces during a battle in the state of Puebla on May 5, 1862.
Chapter 2

METHODOLOGY

This qualitative research consists of two parts aimed at investigating the existence of a full three-stage cycle of production of space in selected Mexicano communities throughout the southwest. This research also applies the framework of the three-stage cycle of production to understand the transformation of existing urban landscapes by Mexicano communities in Albuquerque.

First, I developed a conceptual diagram of what the three-stage cycle would look like, then looked at historical literature that aided me in attributing characteristics and facts to stages I and II of the model. El Mercado de Los Angeles located in Boyle Heights, CA; South El Paso Street, El Paso, TX and the Palomino neighborhood in Scottsdale, AZ, serve as case studies of Mexicano places demonstrating the existence or absence of the three stage-cycle model.

I relied on field observation for data on all three case studies, which began on December 2008 and ended the summer of 2009.

I began to analyze each of the case studies at a very general level. Preliminary and exploratory site visits were conducted for the case studies as follows:

**Table 1: Case study site visit #1**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Dates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td>December 28, 2008 and January 3, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Paso, TX</td>
<td>February 7th and 8th, March 22nd and 23rd, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottsdale, AZ</td>
<td>March 26, 27, and 28, 2009</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
During the exploratory visits my observations included note taking, sketching and photographing. I also engaged with the people/space being observed, by participating in the activity being observed, e.g. purchasing a paleta (popsicle) so that I could blend in the environment. Many of the interactions with people in the spaces also resulted in anecdotal stories that I will use to explain situations and draw conclusions about why the use of the space happens in a certain way. These anecdotal stories surfaced from direct observations and overheard conversations and not from formal interviews from patrons at these public spaces.

After the three initial exploratory visits, I also developed an analytical tool to conduct each case study. The analytical tool used came from further expansion of each stage of the model since it lacked concreteness and included unique characteristics expressed in the physical form previously identified during the exploratory visits. These physical characteristics were then cross-referenced with characteristics inferred from the production of space theories reviewed and assigned to a specific stage in the cycle, and later translated into a checklist that was then applied to each case study location (Table 3, page 21).

After the initial exploratory visits familiarized me with the space, I was able to single out identifiable markers at each site that were summarized into a matrix (see Table 4 page 23).

I chose to apply a ¼ mile radius around each case study site to analyze it and its surrounding area. The ¼ mile radius facilitated my ability to access the site on foot. Application of the analytical tool (checklist) to the case study sites were done on the following dates:
## Table 2: Case study site visit #2

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Case Study</th>
<th>Date(s)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Los Angeles, CA</td>
<td>May 4, 5, 6 and 7, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>El Paso, TX</td>
<td>June 5 and 6&lt;sup&gt;th&lt;/sup&gt;, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Scottsdale, AZ</td>
<td>July 11, 2009</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Stage I</strong></td>
<td><strong>Stage II</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>FORMATION</td>
<td>TRANSFORMATION</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1. Penetration  
  - Visible presence of Mexicanos     
  - Common language Spanish     | 1. Individualistic character  
  - Bright color Scheme     
  - Religious Iconography     | 1. Government agencies  
  - Codifications     
  - plans     | 2. Barrioization  
  - Neighborhood Conditions  
  Cheap rents     
  - Crime Bars on home     
  Graffiti     
  - Negative land uses     | 2. Place Making  
  - Spaces of Rep Spontaneous spaces of gathering  
  Sidewalks     
  Streets     
  Music     | 2. Private sector  
  - investment     | 2. Recognition  
  - Commercial activity catering to cultural needs  
 Carnicerias     
 Street Vendors     
 Money sending services     | 3. Commercial-space serves social function  
 Information board     
 Sitting area     |
During the second round of visits, I surveyed the area on foot, checklist on hand and checked each item identified on the list as markers became apparent.

Next, I identified Mexicano enclaves within Albuquerque against which to compare the cycle of production markers from the case studies. These sites were initially identified by my own fieldwork observations of the Albuquerque landscape during the spring semester of 2008. These field observations of the Albuquerque area were intended to identify changes in the landscape, particularly distinguishable Mexicano spaces. During the last two weekends of February and the first two weekends in March 2008, I conducted a windshield survey of Albuquerque on a quest for distinguishable changes in the landscape.

After the field observations identified distinctive pockets of Mexicano space in the city, I cross-referenced those geographical locations with census block data. The data confirmed high concentrations of persons of Mexican origin living in these areas. I generated a Geographic Information Systems (GIS) map from the data to clearly identify concentrations of persons of Mexican decent higher than forty percent in the city (see Map 5, page 69). The GIS map served as a reliability tool after the windshield survey and helped me identify the Zuni area as a potential case study for Albuquerque. The Zuni area was chosen for analysis because it showed a 55% demographic concentration of Mexicanos and because physical transformations to the landscape according to identified markers were obvious indicators.
### Table 4: Phases/Markers Matrix

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I: Formation</th>
<th>Penetration</th>
<th>Barrioization</th>
<th>Recognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|              | -Arrival of ethnic group  
-Settlement in a specific locale | -Increase in numbers of ethnic group  
-Grow and expand as more people arrive  
Social networks  
- Kinship  
- paisanaje | -Place is viewed as "special" by outsiders-a culturally unique locale  
-Private business sector sees opportunity to capitalize on the specialness of the locale  
-commercial growth in area by outsider businesses to appeal to a wider population  
-commercial business that capitalize on the needs of Mexican community (ie: money transfer & Scards) |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>II: Transformation</th>
<th>Idiosyncratic character</th>
<th>Place-Making</th>
<th>Recognition</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                    | -Ethnic & cultural branding/tagging of the physical landscape (ie: colors, iconography)  
-Use of red, green, white  
-Use of religious and indigenous images (ie: Virgin of Guadalupe, Maya/Aztec)  
-Signage geared to Spanish-speaking community. | -Place reflects a more permanent & rooted community status  
-Use of colors & iconography becomes more intentional (ie: murals tell as story)  
-Place fosters a sense of belonging & security with Mexicanos  
-Non-Mexicanos (outsiders) recognize this as a place where to get Mexican goods  
-I is used as a place for social gathering and interaction  
-Taco trucks, palerteros | -Place is viewed as "special" by outsiders-a culturally unique locale  
-Private business sector sees opportunity to capitalize on the specialness of the locale  
-commercial growth in area by outsider businesses to appeal to a wider population  
-commercial business that capitalize on the needs of Mexican community (ie: money transfer & Scards) |

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>III: Displacement</th>
<th>Gentrification</th>
<th>Government Intervention</th>
<th>Private investment</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>
|                  | -Public sees a way to capitalize on this space: lower rents & commercial opportunities  
-“faux Mexican” foods sold  
- Outsider-owned shops appeal to outsiders who wish to shop in the area (w/o language or cultural issues)  
-Co-opting of Mexican culture by outsiders. | -Government recognizes the community’s uniqueness & in an effort to capitalize on that creates zones such as "Mexican Town".  
-New rules and zoning applied to zone coupled w/ implementation | -Private companies are drawn to the place due to more mainstream acceptance & government rules.  
-This place is seen as being safer to outsiders.  
-Greater public investment in commercial enterprises within the place “diamond in the rough” type of image. |
Chapter 3

IV. THREE-STAGE CYCLE OF SPATIAL PRODUCTION

Figure 3.1

This diagram depicts an abstract form of the three-stage cycle. Developed by author.

**INTRODUCTION**

My personal experience inquiry of Santa Ana, (refer to the preface) backed by Henri Lefebvre’s (1995) production of space theory helped me to further understand that the space produced in Mexicano communities was occurring in cycles. A closer look at Lefebvre’s third level of the production of space theory, *spaces of representation* further helped to support the idea that this production of space in Mexicano spaces happens in three stages.

To Lefebvre (1995), spaces of representation or *lived space* are the emotional experience of space that develops through spatial practices and representations of space. Lived spaces are clearly seen in Mexicano explicit spaces in Mexican communities in the United States. These spaces are gradually produced, and cycle through three stages - manifesting themselves in public spaces centered on social activities and commerce moving along a formation-transformation-displacement continuum. (Figure 3.2, page 24)
The cycle begins with the formation of an enclave, followed by the transformation of the urban landscape, which allows for commercial and social activity to sprout. Social activity is noticeable at places of commerce or surrounding open/public spaces like sidewalks. At this stage, the success of the place is now recognizable, and the success of the space attracts private and public sectors that cash in on its success, resulting in one of two outcomes 1) inevitable displacement or 2) empowerment.

What follows is a detailed description of the three-stage cycle of production that forms the conception of this thesis.

**Figure 3.2**
**STAGE I - FORMATION** *(process by which Mexicanos stake territorial claim)*

**Penetration**

Stage I, formation, is comprised of two sub-stages: Penetration and Barrioization. Formation begins when Mexican immigrants start to populate a particular place. This action is called *penetration* (Duncan & Duncan, 1957). When applied to Stage I, the new residents are not necessarily members of another race, but distinctively a different group of persons. The presence of significant numbers of Mexicanos is the onset of the process of formation; thus the basis for stage I.

**Barrioization**

Once penetration has been established, barrioization follows. Mexican barrios begin to form as recently-arrived immigrants stake out affordable territory. The areas in which Mexican immigrants first move in, or in which penetration occurs are commonly poor neighborhoods where rents are cheap, crime is high and negative land uses (i.e. dumping on vacant lots) are present. Additional new immigrants end up in the barrios because they are following social networks consisting of kinship, friendship and *paisano-naje* relations that link them to the barrio. Barrios grow and expand acquiring a perpetual cycle as more immigrants continue arriving in the area.

**STAGE II – Transformation**

The second stage begins with the slow and steady physical transformation of the area; it is comprised of three sub-categories: Idiosyncratic character, place-making and recognition.
Idiosyncratic character

I use the term *idiosyncratic character* to describe the process in which Mexicanos individualize places they frequent and inhabit. Individualization of the area usually happens by changing or altering the existing physical environment with distinctive Mexican features. These changes are intentional and distinct. For example, store facades are often transformed by painting them in bright and festive colors; usually using red, white and green colors (the colors of the Mexican flag). Distinctive murals on store fronts and blank neighborhood walls are also often painted depicting religious icons and symbols; such as the Our Lady of Guadalupe\(^\text{11}\) (see figure 3.3, page 28) or symbols of indigenous cultures like the Maya and Aztecs. Of course, Spanish language is also introduced in storefront signage; in fact language alone sets many of the buildings apart from the surrounding landscape. Recall Herzog’s definition of barriology as the process by which Mexicans begin to assert control over their neighborhood through the use of art and murals to create identity.

Permanence plays an important role in this phase. Individualistic characteristics are often temporary; they are not fixed within the structure and are easy to remove. For instance, if the Mexicano population is displaced or moves because of lack of jobs or deportation these characteristics are easy to leave behind. If the characteristics are not allowed to mature they do not acquire place-making status.

\(^{11}\) In 1531 the Virgin Mary appeared to an indigenous man named Juan Diego at Tepeyac near what is now Mexico City. The Virgin Mary left an imprint image of herself on the cloak worn by Juan Diego the day of the apparition. She is a brown-skinned woman surrounded by the sun, cloaked in a blue mantle covered with stars, standing on a crescent moon held by an angel.
Barriology

Murals are a common sight in Mexico and are traditionally used as a form of political communication and propaganda. The use of murals in Mexico stems from the muralist movement in the early to mid twentieth century, examples of the movement are the murals painted by Orozco, Rivera and Siqueiros12 during the revolution which expressed social ideologies (see figure 3.4, pg 29).

Today many murals found in Mexicano communities in the United States are a bricolage of political, religious and whimsical expressions and have a clear connection with Mexico. For example, painting the image of Our Lady of Guadalupe on storefronts and on neighborhood walls is a clear sign of an allegiance with Mexico. The image of Guadalupe is the most prevalent religious icon in Mexico, its importance is such that it served as a banner of the rebellion against Spanish rule during the 1810 war of independence, and still remains a potent symbol of the nation. Other less symbolic but equally recognizable images are the illustrations of farm animals painted around the exterior walls of a building like pigs and jersey cows indicating a carnicería (butcher shop) or a cornucopia pointing out a frutería (produce store). These murals add a strong visual element to the physical structures of the urban landscape and serve as an important commu-

12 Mexican muralists often referred to as The Three Great Ones whose art had a sociopolitical theme
nunication tool. The images convey a meaning for inviting Mexican immigrants into the space but at the same time it does not purposely excludes others.

**Place-making**

There are several definitions of place-making; this term usually describes the act of staking claim to a place. In the planning field place-making is referred to as a set of ideas about creating cities in ways that result in high-quality spaces where people naturally want to live, play and work (Kent, 2008). In this thesis, I use this term to describe a dynamic human function in which people transform a place to feel a sense of belonging.

In the three-stage cycle of production proposed in this thesis, place-making occurs when the landscape, not only the physical buildings of a place but also the abstract spaces in between, begins to transform. Barriology and spaces of representation are the two main components in the transformation towards place-making. Lefebvre’s space of representation definition tells us that spaces have symbolic meaning embedded in their spatial form. By applying the barriology and spaces of representation definitions one can

---

**Figure 3.4**

*Mural by Orozco (1937-1938), Teatro Degollado, Guadalajara, Jalisco, Mexico*

Source: Author, June 2008
observe how these two processes aid in the transformation of spaces that foster social interactions between people.

**Spaces of Representation**

Spaces that are directly lived, occupied and transformed by inhabiting them result in spaces that have symbolic meaning embedded in their spatial form. For instance, the use of a street as a pseudo plaza on the weekends is a result of intentional practice - people inhabiting it in a certain way for a certain reason. Sidewalks begin to transform and begin to serve as public spaces where social interactions take place. For example, if a street lined with shops begins to be utilized more frequently by people as a place of interaction, street vendors may begin to occupy the street and local business owners may bleed their business onto the sidewalk to better interact with customers. Activities like these can create a consciousness of place by inscribing Mexican cultural origins in order to enrich the experience of those who occupy the space with the intention of achieving a sense of belonging. In the same way, music is often used to control and define a space; the audio mechanism creates a tangible but unseen space where one is welcomed and feels comfortable. Props like chairs, benches and umbrellas also produce a sense of security in a place by acting as markers for territory.

**Recognition**

Once idiosyncratic character has taken hold in a given place, and place-making has been established, recognition follows; the concluding step in the process of transformation. Recognition is the term that I use in this thesis to describe the process in which a physically transformed place begins to be noticed as something special, and stands out
from the rest of the urban landscape. In this step special attention is paid to the commercial activity that caters to the specific cultural needs of Mexicanos. For example, commercial businesses that provide the Mexicano community with goods and services become a dominant sight. Carnicerias and paleterias (ice-pop shops) are examples of such businesses that transcend their retail role and serve a social and cultural function in the community. Carnicerias not only sell specialty meats but also offer other edible Mexican products not found in mainstream grocery stores. Paleterias offer a unique assortment of cold and frozen treats common in Mexico. One unique characteristic of carnicerias and paleterias is that they often serve as places for social interaction. Carnicerias often sell prepared Mexican foods and provide a small lunch counter or seating area where customers can enjoy a quick close to home-made-meal and strike casual conversations with other customers. Paleterias serve as a gathering place even when a seating area is not provided; customers usually buy their treats and hang out in the parking lot, especially in the summer months. Both carnicerias and paleterias serve as the information headquarters for the community usually providing a space (usually a corner in a wall or a makeshift board) for posting and sharing word-of-mouth information.

Other places that transcend their retail role and serve a social function are street vendors and casas de cambio\(^\text{13}\) (cash transfer places). Casas de cambio provide money wiring services and telephone services for maintaining connections with family in Mexico. Taco trucks fall in the street vendor category because they are mobile, although they are a sometimes a permanent fixture in the community. Taco trucks are large food trucks

\(^\text{13}\) Currency exchange. Casas de cambio have evolved from exchanging currencies (i.e. pesos to dollars) and with the advancement of technologies in the banking and financial arena are now places where remittances are made.
that are a type of “mobile” restaurant that offers traditional Mexican foods and antojitos\textsuperscript{14} to customers. Taco trucks are often seen in construction sites during the day and parked outside a bar or night club at night. Places like casas de cambio and taco trucks provide Mexicanos the necessary products and services for living in the United States and yet allows them to carve out a piece of their host environment and transform it into something personal and meaningful.

Recognition also includes outsiders who frequent these places, residents of the city at large who are not necessarily Mexicanos but seek goods and services in the area.

\textbf{Figure 3.5}

![Image of common sitting/eating area inside Pro Ranch Market, Phoenix, AZ.]

Source: Author, July 2009

\textit{Above: common sitting/eating area inside Pro Ranch Market, Phoenix, AZ.}

\textbf{STAGE III – Displacement}

Once “organic” Mexican places are noticed and recognized by the general public and receive special notice by government agencies and/or the private sector, the third and

\textsuperscript{14} The word antojito literally means “little cravings”. Antojitos are Mexico’s version of tapas/appetizers they can be described as small dishes that are meant to be consumed informally, either from street vendors most often as a late night snack or as appetizers before dinner.
final stage of the cycle begins. The government and/or public sector begin to visualize these Mexican areas as profitable places and further transform them into specious “Latino districts” or “Mexican towns”. The result can be one of two outcomes: 1) inevitable displacement, where established merchants can no longer afford to remain in their business and customers cannot afford to shop in the new district; or 2) empowerment, where Mexican residents exert control over the place.

1) INEVITABLE DISPLACEMENT

Literature on gentrification shows us that displacement as an outcome in this part of the cycle is not unusual, and promoters of gentrification may explain the phenomenon as natural and inevitable (Mumm, 2008). Furthermore, this process of displacement is often viewed as organic and sometimes even random usually shaped by the market economy. Boyd (2008) states that,

*The literature on gentrification has focused on the behavior of Whites, either as gentrifiers or as economic elites responsible for patterns of disinvestment and reinvestment.*

This thesis argues that gentrification besides being a market-driven process is also a matter of race and power. Mexican immigrants, because of their lesser ability to assert their rights in this country are powerless and are easily moved to the side in the name of urban progress. Smith (1996) argues that gentrification is not random, but rather a calculated process designed to benefit developers, speculators and investors (p. 23).
Government agencies

Local government agencies can play a significant role in the displacement phase of the three-stage cycle. Government intervention through code enforcement, zoning regulation and ordinance implementation is the mechanism that starts the morphing of Mexican explicit places into faux Mexican-themed but vibrant retail and commercial spaces. Regulations can lead to exclusion of some spatial practices. Recall LeFebvre’s explanation of representations of space, how zoning regulations can be interpreted as representation of the government’s political power to include or exclude certain spatial practices. For example, in Los Angeles, CA conflict over mexicanization of spaces has sparked governing bodies to implement measures aimed at de-mexicanizing these spaces. Resolutions like the one passed by Los Angeles County District, 1, which restricts taco trucks from becoming stationary. The new rule states that taco trucks will have to change location every hour, or face a misdemeanor charge ($1,000 fine and/or jail).

Private Sector

Established successful Mexican commercial spaces also draw the attention of private sector investment. Investors are faced with a “diamond in the rough” opportunity for investment, and new investment usually removes the formal local economy that was once prominent in the area. The transformation of the place into a faux Latino-district becomes a novelty in the city, an attraction and destination that neglects to advance the vision of those who were there first.

2) EMPOWERMENT

Though, displacement is often the outcome of the third cycle displacement is not inevitable. Barriology (through community organizations) is a way to encourage communi-
ty engagement in the planning process. It is a powerful tool for a community to take control of development efforts.
Chapter 4

Comparative Case Studies

I. Overview

This background sets the stage for El Mercado, South El Paso Street and the Palomino neighborhood case studies. Part two of this chapter details a description of the three stage cycle of production for each of the case studies; photographs are included and are used to help illustrate site specific examples. For the most part, the first stage of the cycle of production [formation] in all three case studies begins in the early decades of the 20th century, when the first large-scale migration of Mexicans to the United States took place as a result of the recruitment efforts of United States companies of Mexican workers. Each of the cases describes the specifics, describing the reasons for the formation and location of the barrios.

Transformation of the physical follows the formation stage and essentially demonstrates the assertion of Mexican identity onto the physical space. Barriology and spaces of representation paradigms help illustrate how these Mexican communities attain and retain a sense of belonging. In this stage I identify commercial activity that caters to cultural needs as well as those commercial spaces that serve a social function and describe the ways that language, symbols and colors are expressed in the storefronts of commercial spaces.
The third stage of the cycle in each of the case studies point out instances that have lead to displacement, more often than not gentrification plays an important role in the transition of stage II to stage III of the cycle.

Each case study concludes with a summary evaluating where each site is in relation to the three-stage cycle of production.

I. El Mercado de Los Ángeles, Boyle Heights, CA

Background:

Although Boyle Heights does not have an official boundary, for the purpose of this thesis, Boyle Heights is demarcated by the Los Angeles River to the east, Indiana Street to the west, south of Marengo Blvd and north of Olympic Street; in the City of Los Angeles, Los Angeles County in the state of California. El Mercado de Los Angeles is located on the corner of First Street and Lorena Street, it is a 36,988 square foot three-story building that has been in existence for nearly 40 years. (See Map 1, page 37)
Historically, Boyle Heights has been an area of transformation, and has long been a destination for newcomers to Los Angeles, CA. First settled by Irish immigrants, it later became diversified, becoming a place of residence for immigrant Jews, white Eastern Europeans, Japanese, Mexicans and Blacks. Today Boyle Heights is a predominant His-
panic\textsuperscript{15} community. If you were to visit Los Angeles from out of town you would see the tremendous impact the Mexican culture has had in this portion of the city.

In 1858 an Irish immigrant named Andrew Boyle bought land for the purpose of planting vineyards in an area called \textit{Paredon Blanco (White Bluffs)}. Paredon Blanco was the name given to the area when California was still part of Mexico (Sanchez, 2004). Andrew Boyle died in 1871 leaving this vast land to his daughter Maria Boyle Workman. Maria’s husband William H. Workman subdivided the land in 1875 for the purpose of selling it for residential development giving it the name of Boyle Heights in honor of Andrew Boyle. In 1876 when the Southern Pacific Railroad moved toward Los Angeles, the now subdivided tracts were marketed as residential property for wealthy families when real estate speculators believed that these affluent families were going to come in and settle in Los Angeles.\textsuperscript{16}

However, for a variety of reasons, including the economic boom-bust cycles in the United States during that era and the easy availability of prime residential real estate elsewhere, Boyle Heights did not prove as attractive as real estate developers and speculators had hoped.\textsuperscript{17} Other communities, such as Pasadena, Glendale, the San Fernando and San Gabriel Valleys, and West Los Angeles proved much more attractive to new and wealthier Los Angeles area residents. Furthermore, the construction of the sprawling Pacific Electric Interurban Rail System by Real Estate magnate Henry Huntington in the early 1900's and the development and popularity of the automobile soon after that were among the factors that made Boyle Heights a non-desirable residential area. Despite its proximity to the Los Angeles Central Business District Boyle Heights quickly declined

\begin{itemize}
\item \textsuperscript{15} Hispanic as defined by the U.S. Census
\item \textsuperscript{16} See http://college.usc.edu/ase/bhproject/ February 9, 2009
\item \textsuperscript{17} Ibid.
\end{itemize}
giving many working class families an opportunity to form communities east of the Los Angeles River. Rising real estate values and racially discriminatory housing restrictions in other parts of the city further contributed to the relegation of Boyle Heights as a residential area for people excluded from living in other parts of the Los Angeles area by the early 1900s; many of these people of lesser means were of Mexican origin.

II. **South El Paso Street, El Paso, TX**

![Image of South El Paso Street]

**Background:**

South El Paso Street is located in downtown El Paso, Texas. Directionally it runs north-south, for the purpose of this thesis, I look at the stretch beginning at San Antonio Street to the north and ending at the Paso Del Norte International Bridge to the south, connecting the street with Ciudad Juarez, Chihuahua, Mexico. (See Map 2, page 42)

El Paso, Texas has been a bi-cultural and bi-heritage city since the late 1500’s; it is located on the far western edge of Texas on the north bank of the Rio Grande. Inhabited for centuries by various Indigenous groups, El Paso saw its first Europeans in 1581 when the Rodriguez-Sanchez expedition passed through. Today El Paso is a predominantly Hispanic city with persons of Mexican decent making up two thirds of the city’s population.

---

18 Over 78 percent of El Paso’s population was Hispanic or Latino according to the 2000 Census.
Seventeen years after the Rodriguez-Sanchez expedition, Don Juan de Oñate took formal possession of the territory in 1598 and christened it "El Paso del Norte," or "the Pass of the North." El Paso del Norte’s territory included the area known today as El Paso and Ciudad Juarez and the population was comprised of Spaniards, Mestizos and Indians mainly due to the Pueblo revolt of 1680 that sent both Spanish colonists and Tigua Indians towards the region looking for safety (Garcia, 1981).

The entire El Paso area became part of Mexico in 1821 when Mexico won its independence from Spain. In the same manner that California’s boundary with Mexico was marked by the 1848 Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo, the Texas border with Mexico was also marked when Mexico ceded the territory of El Paso (north of the Rio Grande) to the United States. At that time, El Paso was a series of five small scattered settlements (Frontera, El Molino, Franklin, Magoffinsville and Concordia) on the north bank of the Rio Grande with just a few hundred residents.

In 1857 the Butterfield Overland Mail Company hired Anson Mills to build its stage offices in El Paso; he was also later hired to survey the settlement known as Frank-

3. **Palomino neighborhood, AZ**

**Background:**

The boundaries for the Scottsdale case study focus area are south of Bell Road, north of Greenway Avenue, west of the 32nd Street and east of Cave Creek Avenue; in the City of Scottsdale, Arizona. (See Map 3 below)

**Map 3**

Source: City of Phoenix, Neighborhood Services Department
Although located in the southwest, Scottsdale’s history is different than other cities in this part of the United States. Unlike Los Angeles, El Paso or even Albuquerque, Scottsdale settlements have been largely “Anglo rather than Spanish or Mexican” (Oberle, 2006, p. 151). Scottsdale modern history begins with its eastern neighbor, Phoenix, during the second half of the 19th century. In 1867 when Jack Swilling of Wickenburg stopped to rest his horse at the foot of the north slopes of the White Tank Mountains, he saw farmland, predominately free of rocks, in a place beyond the reach of heavy frost or snow that needed water. Swilling returned to Wickenburg and organized the Swilling Irrigation Canal Company, and shortly after moved into the Valley. The same year, the company began digging a canal to divert some of the water of the Salt River onto the lands of the Valley. By March 1868, a small colony had formed approximately four miles east of present day Phoenix, water was flowing through the canal, and a few members of the company raised meager crops that summer.\(^\text{19}\) Swilling’s Mill became the new name of the area, it was then changed to Helling Mill, after which it became Mill City, and years later, East Phoenix.

\(^{19}\)For more on the history of Phoenix see http://phoenix.gov/CITYGOV/history.html
II. THE THREE-STAGE CYCLE OF SPATIAL PRODUCTION:

1. EL MERCADO DE LOS ANGELES, BOYLE HEIGHTS

STAGE I – Formation

Penetration

A large influx of Mexican immigrants poured into Los Angeles during the Mexican Revolution from the period of 1911 to 1920 (Allen & Turner, 1997). In the early 1920’s, Mexicans began to move toward the eastside of the river, including Boyle Heights. As the Jewish community began to move outward towards the west side of Los Angeles, Boyle Heights became predominately Mexican during the mid 1950s to the early 1960s.

According to Duncan and Duncan (1957) penetration occurs when residents of another race move into a neighborhood, in this case Mexicano residents started to move into the Boyle Heights area between 1911 and 1920 according to Allen and Turner (1997). Recall, invasion happens when a substantial number of members of another race move into a neighborhood, here Mexicans began to move toward Boyle Heights in the early 1920’s and the Jewish community began to move outward towards the west side of Los Angeles.

Barrioization

Over the next few decades following the initial influx of Mexicano residents (1911-1920) Boyle Heights saw a continued increase in numbers of new Mexicano residents. By applying Duncan and Duncan (1957) explanation of the invasion/succession model this aggregation of Mexican residents can be explained and the result is the continuous increase of Mexicano density despite the physical constraints of the geographical
area. The U.S. census data clearly demonstrates barrioization as it indicates that Boyle Heights is predominately Mexican.  

**STAGE II: Transformation**

...Los Angeles, a city inhabited by over a million persons of Mexican origin. At first sight the visitor is surprised not only by the purity of the sky and the ugliness of the dispersed and ostentatious buildings, but also by the city's vaguely Mexican atmosphere, which cannot be captured in words or concepts. This Mexicanism – delight in decorations, carelessness and pomp, negligence, passion and reserve- floats in the air. I say “floats” because it never mixes or unites with the other world, the North American world based on precision and efficiency. It floats without, offering any opposition; it hovers, blown here and there by the wind, sometimes breaking up like a cloud, sometimes standing erect like a rising skyrocket. It creeps, it wrinkles, it expands and contracts; it sleeps or dreams; it is ragged but beautiful. It floats, never quite existing, never quite vanishing.– Octavio Paz

This was Octavio Paz’ view of Los Angeles in the 1960’s and much has changed since then. The Mexicanism that he spoke of does not “float” in the air now, it is palpable, blatant and in your face, what fallows are examples of the undoubtedly territorial presence of Mexicanos in Boyle Heights, particularly in El Mercado de Los Angeles.

**Idiosyncratic Character**

Idiosyncratic characteristics of El Mercado are spread through a large spectrum of visual representations and symbols. Mexican identity is embedded in the physical form. Spanish signage is seen throughout the structure (see figure 4.1, page 45), along with unmistakable Mexican symbols, iconography (see figure 4.2, page 45) and vibrant color scheme; bright, bold colors are present in both exterior and interior walls of the building. Individual commercial stands distinguish themselves from one another by contrasting colors with their immediate neighbors.

---

20 U.S. Census Bureau. (2000). *American Fact Finder*
Barriology

Applying Herzog’s (2004) barriology paradigm, cultural ownership is easily recognizable in El Mercado de Los Angeles and its surrounding area. Vendors and Mercado patrons have asserted control over the space through the personalization or Mexicанизation of the space. A consciousness of the place is palpable and vignettes of Mexican cultural origins are inscribed throughout the Mercado and the immediate neighborhood surrounding it. Murals such as the one below (figure 4.3) enrich the experience of those who occupy the space and inevitably give Mexican residents a sense of belonging.
Spaces of representation

A unique symbolic meaning is embedded in El Mercado’s physical form. Every inch of its 36,988 square feet is transformed by the people who occupy it. The different ways that people use the space results in different social relations that happen within the space, and these social relations are a result of Mexicano identity playing out in the space.

There are countless ways to describe the symbolic meaning in El Mercado, but one that I found particularly interesting was the social interactions that happen around food. At the rear of the main building, adjacent to the parking lot, are four food vendors whose specialty is traditional snack foods. The four vendors are situated inside a detached semi-enclosed structure resembling a hallway. Access to the roofed structure is through either the north or south, as there are no walls on either of these two sides. As you walk through the structure as you would a hallway, you find two vendors to either side of the hallway enclosing the space to the east and west. The vendors are in close proximity to each other, the hallway between them is no more than ten feet in width (see figure 4.4, page 47). People form long and chaotic lines to place an order with any of these four vendors. The physical space in this 10ft wide space is transformed by the way it’s used; the structure becomes a buzzing socializing spot in the Mercado. People linger within the space after purchasing their snack despite the constraints of the physical space. There are no formal sitting spaces in or around the structure nonetheless social interactions take place. Entire families are seen standing, eating, and talking; others find a sitting spot by turning over buckets or squatting on the floor as they enjoy their snack and
engage in people-watching. This particular space that is directly lived and occupied in this way results in a transformed space with a symbolic meaning embedded in it.

**Recognition**

It could be stated that all of the commercial activity in El Mercado caters to the specific cultural needs of Mexicanos. There are over 60 Mexican vendors\(^{21}\) in the Mercado who offer a range of Mexican products and services. The basement level offers customers clothes, hats, boots, jewelry, a wide variety of Mexican music, and Mexican candy among other miscellaneous products. On the first floor you can find small restaurants offering prepared Mexican food, a carniceria, traditional baked goods (pan dulce), groceries and natural herbs. The second floor has two full service restaurants that feature live Mariachi music. El Mercado has gained popularity and recognition as being the place to go if you are seeking Mexicano items. El Mercado has acquired a magnet-like attraction

\(^{21}\) Vendors were counted during a site visit in May, 2009 by author.
not only for Mexicanos but others who seek a feel and atmosphere of Mexican authenticity.

**Commercial activity catering to cultural needs**

All commercial activity catering to Mexicano needs can be found inside El Mercado. Carnicerias and casas de cambio are located inside El Mercado, a taco truck was present within a block from El Mercado and a *paletero* (person who sells ice-pops from a push cart) was seen transiting the neighborhood.

**Commercial space serving a social function**

All established commercial businesses inside El Mercado served as a place for social interactions between customers to take place, particularly the roofed detached vendor structure. El Mercado also serves as a place for gathering and socializing, and also provides a venue for local information to be shared and advertised, an information board is located on the first floor.

**STAGE III – Displacement**

Formalization of the Mercado by city entities has been a topic of controversy for about a decade now. Neighborhood associations surrounding the Mercado have repeatedly complained of activities happening in the Mercado. Neighbors complain of the increase of car activity especially during weekends, due to the popularity of the Mercado. Neighbors also complain of the decibel level of the music played by the Mariachi and other musical groups at the restaurant and the lingering of patrons after the restaurants have closed. The disapproval of these activities has sparked constant conflict between

---

22 These interactions were noticed during five different site visits to El Mercado by the author.
neighbors, the El Mercado owner and Mercado vendors that has resulted in the intervention of the City of Los Angeles.  

**Summary:**

Located in Boyle Heights, a suburb within the city of Los Angeles, CA, El Mercado de Los Angeles is an example of a place transformed by Mexicanos [owners, vendors and patrons] from a strictly commercial space into a space apt for socializing.

Today, Boyle Heights is almost 100% Latino consisting mainly of Mexican immigrants with Spanish being the primary language of the community. The urban landscape of Boyle Heights has been changed to accommodate the large Mexican population in the city, and its culture is reflected in many spaces; such is the case of El Mercado de Los Angeles.

El Mercado is a particularly relevant case study for this thesis for three reasons: 1) it is located in the city of Los Angeles, a city with a high influx of Mexican immigrants; 2) originally it was not planned as an explicitly Mexicano place, and 3) it currently is a popular gathering place for Mexicanos. El Mercado’s atmosphere and character as it is today organically grew as Mexicanos/as and newly-arrived Mexican immigrants in the area started establishing stalls in the Mercado as a means of earning a living. The stalls were haphazardly placed throughout the property giving it the feel of a traditional tianguis.

---

http://articles.latimes.com/2008/nov/29/local/me-mercado29


26 Tianguis is a Nahuatl word meaning marketplace. In Mexico is common to see public outdoor markets which are called tianguis.
Evaluation of El Mercado de Los Angeles site using the three-stage model indicates that the site has completed stages I and II of the three-stage-cycle of production. El Mercado de Los Angeles has gone through a period of gradual formalization by city agencies; and therefore has entered stage III of the cycle. As a result it has become a major tourist attraction in Los Angeles, where customers both local and foreign experience Mexican culture.

2. SOUTH EL PASO STREET, EL PASO, TX

**STAGE I – Formation**

**Penetration**

El Paso was not really a pueblo or a town in any strict sense during the post-Mexican War period. At that time most Mexicans continued to live on the left bank of the Rio Grande in Paso Del Norte (currently known as Ciudad Juarez) rather than on the American side (Garcia, 1981).

Between 1880 and 1920 El Paso saw large waves of Mexicanos enter southwester labor markets. Even though El Paso served mainly as an entry way for Mexicanos looking for jobs in other states like California, many stayed in the city and entered the labor market there. El Paso received the largest wave of Mexicanos during the Mexican Revolution (1911 – 1920), especially between the period of 1910-1917 when Mexicans were forced to travel North in search of jobs and safety. Mexicanos began to move toward the southern half of the city, what is now downtown. By 1920, second only to San Antonio, TX, El Paso had the second largest Mexican population of any American city.
and was the major southwestern metropolis with more Mexicans than Americans (Clark, 1908).

**Barrioization**

Following the initial influx of Mexican immigrants (1910-1917) El Paso saw a continued increase in numbers of Mexicanos. The Majority of them concentrated in El Paso’s central barrio called *Chihuahuita*\(^27\) [Little Chihuahua], the principal and initial settlement for Mexican immigrants in El Paso located in the southern half of the city (Garcia, 1981). (See Map 4).

---

\(^27\) Chihuahuita received its name from the large number of Mexican immigrants from the northern Mexican state of Chihuahua.
There were two other major Mexican areas in the city of El Paso at that time besides Chihuahuita. Garcia (1981) identified the community of the American Smelting and Refining Company (ASARCO) outside the western limits of the city, and the community adjacent to the yards of the many railroads lines in the southeastern part of the city. For the purpose of the thesis I will concentrate on the settlement of Chihuahuita because South El Paso Street is part of this original settlement.

**STAGE II – Transformation**

“South El Paso Street is the gateway to Old Mexico and the Wild West. Its vibrant streets and unique architecture connects El Paso with our Sister City Juarez, Mexico,” 28 John F. Cook Mayor of El Paso

The transformation of public space in South El Paso Street can be appreciated in the appearance of its store facades, the occupation of its sidewalks and the plastered Spanish-language signs depicting Mexican names or references to Mexico. One experiences the transition into Mexico several blocks before you get to Ciudad Juarez as you pass the many storefronts on this street.

**Idiosyncratic Character**

Idiosyncratic characteristics of South El Paso Street range in shape and form. Here too, Mexican identity is embedded in the physical form; Spanish signage is seen throughout the length of the street, along with unmistakable Mexican symbols and vibrant colors. As seen in the following photos, the explicit welcoming and acceptance of Mexican currency clearly exemplifies a physical manifestation of a Mexican space (see figure 4.5, page 53).

---

Place Making

From San Antonio Street to Father Rham Ave., the last street intersecting El Paso Street before the international bridge, I counted 131 businesses along South El Paso Street. Roughly half of the businesses’ names are in Spanish or bilingual with names like Tepito, La Mexicanita and Neto’s Sports to name a few. Recall, Oberle and Arreola’s (2008) argument that regional identity helps to understand the geographical nuances that immigrants bring with them. Naming businesses after a region or place as in the instance of Tepito shows an allegiance to Mexico as well as staking claim to the place. The merchants feel a sense of belonging and show it by naming their places of business in Spanish. This transformation of the urban place affirms the merchants’ place-making and instills a sense of belonging in their customers. In what follows I outline the barriology paradigm seen in the way vendors and shoppers assert control over the street, especially the sidewalks (see figure 4.6, page 54).

---

29 Tepito is a popular open air market (tianguis) located in Mexico City.
Barriology

Barriological affirmation in this part of the city takes many forms, including community organizations and many programs that aim at the retention of Mexican language and culture. The physical barriological responses are easily recognizable in South El Paso Street. Unmistakable Spanish signage and murals in the area are physical means by which Mexicanos culturally affirm their presence in the area. *Mexicanization* of the space is achieved by the place-specific names given to stores, and the murals painted on the areas’ walls(see figure 4.7 and 4.8, page 55).
Spaces of Representation

Symbolic meanings are embedded along the length of South El Paso Street. The street is transformed by the merchants and patrons who occupy it. The different ways that people use the space results in different social relations that happen within the space and these social relations are a result of Mexican identity acted on the space. Earlier in this thesis, I gave the example of the use of a street as a pseudo plaza as a direct result of people inhabiting it in a certain way. South El Paso Street is a prime example of a space that is directly lived, occupied and transformed by its users. Here the street encourages a merchant/patron dynamic interaction as the sidewalk transforms into an open air market.

Recognition

On October 8, 2008 the American Planning Association (APA) designated South El Paso Street as one of ten Great Streets through its *Great Places in America* program.
APA singled out South El Paso Street because of its historical architecture, unique bi-cultural heritage, and community activism connected with protecting and maintaining the street’s character. This recognition of South El Paso Street’s uniqueness had sparked interest from the City’s regulatory body to revitalize and beautify this part of downtown.

**Commercial activity catering to cultural needs**

Although *carnicerias* are not present in South El Paso Street there are a number of street vendors and *casas de cambio* which are often present in Mexican explicit places. Amuedo-Dorantes and Pozo (2005) highlight the variety of reasons why Mexican immigrants remit money to friends and families back home and recognize casas the cambio as one of three preferred ways in which Mexican immigrants remit earnings to Mexico.

**Commercial space serving a social function**

South El Paso Street encourages people to engage in social interactions. People not only come to this street to do their shopping but also to walk (as exercise)\(^{30}\) and people watch. People sit on benches along the street and are seen engaged in conversations as if “catching up”.\(^{31}\)

**STAGE III – Displacement**

Displacement has not yet happened in South El Paso Street, continued existence of this Mexican place is evident by stores such as *El Encanto*, which has been in existence for more than 40 years. Despite the renovation of downtown, the moving of the bus terminal and the acclaimed recognition the American Planning Association the street remains a Mexican explicit-place.

\(^{30}\) Casual conversation with an individual sitting on a bench next to author on a site visit to South El Paso Street.

\(^{31}\) Observed during site visits, noted by autor.
Summary:

South El Paso Street is an example of the survival and continued existence of a Mexicano transformed space despite the intervention of a regulatory body. South El Paso is mainly a commercial street that fosters socializing activities for its patrons.

The city of El Paso, TX is currently implementing a downtown revitalization program to beautify downtown streets; South El Paso Street is among the streets slated for revitalization under the downtown revitalization plan. The street is also part of The Golden Horseshoe District consisting of six downtown streets. The district is named the Golden Horseshoe because of the U-shape formed by the six streets: San Antonio St., Overland St., El Paso St., Oregon St., Mesa St., and Stanton St. The Golden Horseshoe District is an initiative of the city of El Paso to promote Downtown shopping.

El Paso Street leads south to the pedestrian international bridge into Ciudad Juarez, Mexico and is known for its Mexicano commerce space, which gives it its character, livelihood and ambience. Places of commerce along El Paso Street cater to Mexican shoppers that cross the border on a daily basis to do their shopping in El Paso.

Despite downtown revitalization efforts commercial spaces on South El Paso Street remain physically unaffected by the Downtown 2015 Plan. The sidewalks in South El Paso Street remain a vibrant public space occupied by Mexicanos. Such is the case that in 2008 the American Planning Association (APA) named South El Paso Street one of the Great American Streets.

Like the previous case study, South El Paso Street relevance to this thesis rests on the following reasons: 1) it is located in the border city of El Paso, a city with a historical

---

32For more on the Downtown Plan visit http://www.elpasotexas.gov.downtown
permanence of Mexicanos; 2) organically grew as a Mexicano explicit place, and 3) currently is a popular gathering place for Mexicanos. The street’s flavor is predominantly Mexican with Spanish being the primary language heard through the street. The street has the feel of an open market as store merchandise bleeds onto the sidewalk.

Evaluation of South El Paso St using the three-stage model tells us that the site has completed Stages I and II of the three stage cycle of production, and has entered stage III of the cycle. As a result it is being advertised as a tourist attraction in El Paso, where customers both local and foreign can experience the street’s bi-cultural flare.

3. PALOMINO NEIGHBORHOOD, N.E. PHOENIX, AZ

STAGE I – Formation

Penetration

Unlike California and Texas the Arizona border with Mexico was not defined by the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo. After the signing of the Treaty the Mexican population in Arizona was under Mexican sovereignty (Gonzales, 1999). Pressure in the United States was the force behind wanting to extend the international border further south. On December 30, 1853 Mexico signed the Treaty of Mesilla, in which it sold thirty thousand square miles of land to the United States for ten million dollars.

It was then by default that the Mexicans living in the region became the first settlers of the area. These Arizona Mexicans were largely located in Tucson.
Barrioization

In the late 1800s Scottsdale was a small community of ranchers and citrus growers, but the demand for cotton created during World War I changed Scottsdale’s labor dynamics. Labor to work in the cotton fields was primarily recruited from Sonora, Mexico and the southern Mexican community in southern Arizona (Harner, 2000). The Scottsdale Gin Company was completed in 1916 along with a two-block Mexican barrio. The Scottsdale Historical Museum now stands in what was then the heart of the Mexican barrio; the Mexican barrio flourished during 1920-1960 and encompassed much of what is now Old Town Scottsdale. During the urban renewal era, Scottsdale replaced “undesirable” areas with new construction (Harner, 2000). This was the end of the Mexican barrio and the community was essentially dispersed.

Harner (2000) describes the Palomino neighborhood as one of several Mexican satellite barrios in Scottsdale surrounded by subdivisions that are mostly non-Hispanic. The Palomino neighborhood’s population is mainly made up of Mexican immigrants from the state of Sonora and Chihuahua. The neighborhood is also known as “the square” because it is nearly a square mile surrounded by Cave Creek Road, 32nd Street, Greenway and Bell roads. The square is a low-rent island, surrounded by lily-white enclaves and pricey, red-tiled-roof developments.
**STAGE II – Transformation**

**Idiosyncratic Character**

Idiosyncratic characteristics of the Palomino neighborhood are passive compared with those of El Mercado and South El Paso Street; nonetheless the visible physical changes to the urban environment are noticeable. Mexican identity is also embedded in ‘the square’s’ physical form; names of businesses are proudly displayed in Spanish on the mini-mall signs located in the area. Even when other markers are not present, such as bright colors on the exterior walls of the businesses, signs such as *Neveria Las Tres Reynas* change the built environment by refusing to blend with the rest of the landscape.

(See figure 4.9)

The Palomino neighborhood lacks the characteristic loud Mexican exterior colors. Despite the absence of the color scheme on the buildings themselves, however, the walls of these mini-malls where Mexican businesses mushroom are plastered with bright, showy signs advertising products and services. In fact Arreola and Oberle (2008) state that,

*In the emerging Latino neighborhoods visible changes in the retail landscape are often one of the only outward clues to this rapid ethnic transformation.*

**Figure 4.9**

Spanish Signage-Palomino

**Figure 4.10**

Iconography-Palomino
Place Making

- **Barriology**

There are two neighborhood associations within the Palomino neighborhood boundaries, Palomino Community Power/Palomino Poder de la Comunidad and Palomino United Hispanic Neighbors. During my site visits, neighborhood murals were not observed in the area but barriology can be appreciated through the combined goals of these two organizations:

- Help and support one another
- Unite to have greater strength and power
- Inform immigrants regarding their rights and responsibilities
- Share with others who are (immigrants) and to be heard and included in neighborhood issues
- Promote education for the whole family and to create a safer community for Palomino.

Spaces of representation

**Commercial activity catering to cultural needs**

Spaces of representation are manifested in the carnicerias of the Palomino neighborhood. According to Oberle (2006) carnicerias are often the first sign of the impending neighborhood transformation. They are the perfect example of places that are directly lived, occupied and transformed. Social interaction that happen in the carnicerias produce different lived moments that are not replicated anywhere else.

---

33 These goals were extracted from the neighborhood associations goals as listed in City of Phoenix, Neighborhood Services Department website http://phoenix.gov/phxd/NSDAssoc/search-alpha.do?searchChar=P
**Commercial space serving a social function**

Part of the reason carnicerias become spaces of representation is the fact that carnicerias allow space for socializing (Oberle, 2006). Some of the carnicerias offer ready-to-go traditional Mexican meals, and many times sitting places where these meals can be consumed are provided inside the carnicerias often in the form a common area with a bench/table set-up.

The Palomino neighborhood differs from El Mercado and South El Paso Street cases in that Palomino is home to a legitimized day-labor site. Day-labor sites are often a visible sign of ethnic neighborhood change. For the most part day-labor sites are a demand-supply product of the construction sector. Day-labor sites are usually located in the parking lots of major home-improvement stores, and in clandestine collection areas like highly traveled intersections.

The Macehualli Day Labor Center is located on 25th Street within ‘the square’ (see figure 4.11, page 63). Besides providing a meeting place for dozens of workers and potential employers the center serves as a social gathering place and a safe harbor for undocumented immigrants in the greater Phoenix area.

---

34 Macehualli is a Nahuatl word meaning laborer. The Macehantlin (plural) was a low level social class in the time of the Aztec empire. Artisans, farmers, slaves and some worriers were considered members of this social class.
**STAGE III – Displacement**

Displacement has not yet happened in the Palomino neighborhood, there are no immediate plans for government entities or private investors to come into the area. Challenges\(^{35}\) to the Mexicanidad of the place are only seen through immigration law implementation and tensions between those against undocumented in Arizona in general.

**Summary:**

The Scottsdale case study is particularly interesting as the Mexicano neighborhood is considered to be emerging amidst the sea of upscale suburban homes (Oberle & Arreola, 2008). Strict immigration laws in Arizona and frequent homeland security round ups in Scottsdale make it a fascinating case.

---

\(^{35}\) Macehualli was declared a safe haven for undocumented immigrants. Undocumented immigrants cannot be arrested by immigration authorities while inside the labor center. Border patrol agents were seen driving through the center on numerous occasions during my observations. I interpreted these drive-by visits by immigration authorities as intimidation tactics.
Scottsdale is located in central Arizona, just east of Phoenix. Scottsdale is known for swanky art galleries, craft shops and most notably for its resorts and golf courses. Scottsdale is an ocean of suburban rooftops in monotone desert colors; its real estate market is among the most expensive in the United States. In contrast to the other two case studies, the impact of the Mexican culture on the Scottsdale landscape is not as obvious, Scottsdale’s population is predominately Anglo, about 90% white.\(^{36}\) Mexican communities hide behind art galleries, exclusive shopping centers and luxury home neighborhoods.

Evaluation of the Palomino neighborhood site using the three-stage model tells us that the site has completed stage I of the three-stage-cycle of production. The Palomino neighborhood is entering the transformation stage of the cycle, transformation of the urban landscape is gradually happening, it has not yet received recognition status.

Chapter 5

Comparative Case Study: Albuquerque’s Zuni area

I. Background:

The history of Albuquerque began similarly to that of El Paso, TX in terms of Spanish settlement. The same year that Don Juan de Oñate took formal possession of the territory of El Paso, he passed through the valley of Albuquerque on his way to Northern New Mexico (Sanchez & Miller, 2009). Juan de Oñate and his settlers took notice of the wooded area running along the Rio Grande and a few years later in the early 1600s Spanish settlers began farming lands along what is today the bosque37. The Pueblo Revolt of 1680 drove the Spanish settlers south towards El Paso, but they returned to the area twelve years later in 1692 (Sanchez & Miller, 2009). Albuquerque was formally founded in 1706 by then appointed Spanish Governor Francisco Cuèrvo y Valdès. Cuèrvo y Valdès was appointed as governor by the viceroy, Don Francisco Fernandez de la Cueva Enriquez, Duke of Albuquerque. The town was built in accordance to the laws of the Indies - with a central plaza surrounded by government buildings and a church with streets marked off in a grid pattern around the plaza.

When México gained its independence from Spain in 1821, New Mexico became part of the Mexican territory; making New Mexicans Mexican by nationality (Montgomery, 2002). In 1848 New Mexicans became U.S citizens when the United States acquired New Mexico through the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo.

Today, based on observational and census data analysis of Mexican communities

---

37 Spanish word for woodland. Bosque is the name for areas found along river banks in the southwestern part of the U.S.
in Albuquerque I can say that the areas with Mexicano populations higher than forty percent (according to the Census) correspond to the Zuni, San Jose and South Valley areas of the city and that physical transformation of space by the Mexican Diaspora is evident in these areas (see map 5, page 69). Because the Mexican immigrant population in Albuquerque is fragmented, the Zuni area 38 is chosen for a comparative study. This area is chosen for three reasons; 1) the obvious changes in the landscape, 2) census data showing high concentrations of foreign-born persons from Mexico, and 3) government intervention in the form of plans and resolutions.

II. The Three-Stage Cycle of Spatial Production: Zuni area

STAGE I – Formation

Penetration

Mexicans migrating to New Mexico after 1848 were few in number and were probably absorbed into the existing and well-established native and Hispanic New Mexican population (Chavez, 1984). Mexican migration to New Mexico at this time was slow but constant; most came looking for jobs which they found in the cattle and sheep grazing, agriculture and mining industries (Garcia-Acevedo, 2000).

Montgomery (2002) states that,

*A Mexican-born population never appeared in Santa Fe or Albuquerque in numbers proportional to those of San Antonio, El Paso, or Los Angeles. The reason was New Mexico’s relative dearth of jobs. The same primitive agricultural and industrial conditions that contributed to the territory’s “Mexican” reputation encouraged actual Mexican immigrants to look for better opportunities in Texas or*

---

38 For the purpose of this thesis the Zuni area is demarcated as the area between Louisiana Boulevard to the east, Wyoming Boulevard to the west, Central Avenue to the north and Zuni Road to the south, located within the boundaries of the International District.
California. Indeed, paisanos themselves left the upper Rio Grande on a seasonal basis to find decent wages.

The Mexican revolution played a pivotal role in the increased numbers of Mexican immigration into Albuquerque as it did in Los Angeles and El Paso. Duran (2007) estimated that 900,000 Mexicans fled to the United States during the ten years of the revolution, and (Garcia-Acevedo, 2000) stated that in the early 1920s Albuquerque had 2,000 of the 20,272 Mexican immigrants throughout the rest of the state, having become a “major port of entry for Mexican workers.

**Barrioization**

Although Mexican immigrants in Albuquerque are not as significant in numbers as they are in Boyle Heights and El Paso, making only 18.6% of the total population, their presence is evident by the changes they have made to the urban landscape.

The 2000 census showed that 28,447 foreign-born persons from Mexico resided in Bernalillo County (5% of the total population), up from 11,254 in 1990 (Duran, 2007). The 2005-2007 American Community Survey of the U.S Census Bureau showed yet another increase for a total of 42,484 foreign-born persons from Mexico, with higher concentrations in the Southeast and Southwest quadrants of the city. Most of the Mexican immigrants who have recently arrived in Albuquerque come from northern Mexico, predominantly from the state of Chihuahua. The states of Sonora, Durango, and Zacatecas have also significantly contributed to Albuquerque’s Mexican population; but most new immigrants are Chihuahuenses.40

---

39 U.S. Census Bureau.(2007). American Community Survey
40 Reported by the Arts Alliance of Albuquerque in their Ethnic Culture Survey. In 2002 the Albuquerque Art Alliance received a grant from the State Legislature to support a cultural survey of various ethnic populations that reside in the greater Albuquerque areas. http://abqarts.org/cultural/survey/index.htm
Little literature has been found pinpointing the barrioization of Mexican immigrants in Albuquerque. Lee (2003) names Barelas as a Mexican barrio and Diaz (2005) states that,

*Albuquerque barrios were generally located west, directly adjacent to the civic center. There existed a network of barrios, creating a Chicana/o urban zone in this general vicinity. There were a few census tracts that were predominantly Chicana/o, and one neighborhood, Barelas functioned as the center of cultural and business activity. The 1970 census indicated an expanding representation in the west and southwest quadrants of the city.*

Sanchez and Miller (2009) mention Martineztown as a cluster of New Mexicanos and Hispanics though Mexican immigrants are not specifically mentioned as part of this count. During interviews with Mexican immigrants in Albuquerque, Mendoza (2006) discovered that Mexican immigrants described their places of residence in terms of the geographical location related to one of the four quadrants of the city, rather than specific neighborhoods. During his interviews he also found from key informants that there are no Mexican Barrios in Albuquerque, he attributes this to the fact that the Mexican population is “diluted” into the local Hispano population. Many of his key informants identified areas within the city as those where they knew Mexican immigrants resided for example, Barelas, La Mesa, Zuni, East San Jose, and the South Valley.

Though barrioization of the Zuni area has not been duly documented in the literature, Vicky Gass (1998) identified the neighborhoods of La Mesa and Trumbull which are in the southeast quadrant of the city, as the largest immigrant population in Albuquerque. She explains that the majority of foreign-born residents (the majority coming from Mexico) arrived in two time periods 1980-1981 and 1987-1990, with the biggest between 1980-1989 (p. 39).
Table five shows concentration of Mexican born residents in Albuquerque higher than forty percent broken down by census tract illustrated also in Map 5.

Table 5

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Census Tract</th>
<th>Corresponding Neighborhood</th>
<th>Total Population</th>
<th>Total Mexican</th>
<th>Percentage</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>6.03</td>
<td>La Mesa</td>
<td>5,109</td>
<td>2,243</td>
<td>43.90</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>9.01</td>
<td>Trumbull</td>
<td>7,633</td>
<td>3,555</td>
<td>46.57</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>13</td>
<td>San Jose</td>
<td>4,837</td>
<td>2,676</td>
<td>55.32</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>14</td>
<td>Barelas</td>
<td>3,270</td>
<td>1,582</td>
<td>48.38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>45.01</td>
<td>South Valley</td>
<td>3,492</td>
<td>1,422</td>
<td>40.72</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S Census Bureau adapted by author
**STAGE II – Transformation**

**Idiosyncratic character**

Very few signs or landmarks in Albuquerque will indicate the entrance to a special zone. Unlike places like Old Town and Nobhill that are strategically and purposely marked to announce your arrival at these places, such welcoming signs are not evident when entering the Zuni area in Albuquerque. Carnicería façades with a picturesque painting of a quaint Mexican town in the foreground, a huge painting of the image of Our Lady of Guadalupe or a head of cattle with the branding initials of its owner in its hind is what greets you when entering this neighborhood (see figure 5.1).

Individualization of Mexicano in this area is achieved mainly in commercial spaces by ostentatious facades and incorporation of Spanish language in storefront signs.

**Iconography, Albuquerque**

![Figure 5.1]

**Place Making**

**Barriology**

Although Spanish signage is not as visible as in Los Angeles, CA and El Paso, TX, many businesses in the Zuni area show a sense of belonging in the area they occupy
by incorporating Mexican regional names into their businesses (see figure 5.1, page 70). By contrast to the previous case studies, murals are not frequently present in neighborhood walls, murals are most exclusively seen in places of commerce adorning paletterias and carnicerias’ exterior walls. Despite the lack of muralism Mexicanos are nevertheless asserting control over their neighborhoods through community celebrations and parades to create identity and create a sense of belonging. Community parades like the *Dia de los Muertos* in the south valley and celebrations like *Cinco de Mayo* in the civic plaza help affirm barriology.

Non-profit and community organizations are also helping immigrant groups reinforce barriology. For example, East Central Ministries, a Christian community development ministry works in the neighborhoods of La Mesa and Trumbull on projects that allow residents to fully participate in the development of their community. This organization incorporates cultural relevance into their program.

**Spaces of representation**

Commercial activity catering to cultural need

![Taco Truck, Zuni Area Albuquerque](image)

*Figure 5.2*
The different ways people use spaces result in spaces of representation. Carnicerías and taco trucks provide a space where Mexican immigrants can produce different ‘lived moments’.

On any given night of the week, people gather around the taco truck enjoying a meal while conversing with other *paísans* (people sharing same place of origin). Transformation of space happens usually at dusk, when the taco truck arrives at its preferred street corner, and opens for business for the night. Many Mexicanos (myself included) will not otherwise regularly visit this part of the city during the day or at any other time when the taco truck is not there. The transformation of the space happens on that particular sidewalk because of the social interaction taco truck customers have with each other at that time. People usually stand alongside the truck, waiting for the order to come up, many spontaneous conversations are struck between customers, all in Spanish. Customers continue with casual conversations as they remain in the vicinity of the truck to finish the meal.41

**Commercial space serving a social function**

The Albuquerque’s State Fairgrounds located on the corner on Louisiana Boulevard and Central Avenue provide a space for social interactions for Mexican immigrants. In this case the fairgrounds take the space of the *plaza*, traditionally in pre-Columbian and colonial Mexico, a social function of the plaza was *tianguis* or a site of *paseo*.42 Arreola (1992) describes the *paseo* as involving males strolling around the plaza in one direction and females circulating around it in the opposite direction. Although the *paseo*

---

41 Author’s personal experience
42 Promenade, an activity inherited from Spain and practiced in Mexico in colonial times by the upper classes that lived close to the plaza, the *paseo* is still commonly practiced in Mexico.
was sometimes a daily ritual, more often it occurred on Sunday afternoons and also during several evenings a week. Today, plaza users have discontinued the paseo in its traditional form (courtship) although visiting the plaza on Sundays or weekday evenings continues in most of Mexico. The tianguis is still a very popular activity practiced throughout Mexico. Significance of both the paseo and the tianguis is very much a part of Mexican culture reproduced spatially on Saturdays and Sundays at the fairgrounds.

Albuquerque’s carnicerias, palterias and taco-trucks also provide spaces for socializing and often times provide a physical space where word-of-mouth information is delivered (see figure 5.3). Interior and exterior spaces of commercial spaces frequented by Mexicanos are apt for this type of information exchange.

**Figure 5.3**

This figure advertises roommates wanted, household items for sale, appliance repairs, tutoring and gym membership. All are written in Spanish.

**Recognition**

Recent recognition of the Zuni area as the ‘International District’ has completed stage II and will move this area into stage III of the cycle of spatial production.

City Council introduced resolution R-09-203 recognizing the area in and around Louisiana Boulevard between Central Ave and Zuni Ave as the International District (see
Map 6). The International District Resolution acknowledges that immigrants from Mexico live in that community and that the commerce in and around the area caters to them and other residents of New Mexico. Recognition of the “International District” as such came about as an effort to replace the “war zone” stigma of the area with that of a more attractive notion.

**STAGE III – Displacement**

**Government intervention: Zuni Area**

The introduction of Resolution R-09-203,\(^\text{43}\) which recognizes the Zuni area as part of the “International District” is a good example of how The City of Albuquerque as a regulatory body has recognized the uniqueness of the place and will play a significant role in the three-stage cycle.

\(^{43}\) See City of Albuquerque, Eighteenth Council. Legislation Text File #: R-09-203, Version:2
The International district was created with the passage of Senate Joint Memorial 24 in 2009\textsuperscript{44} sponsored by State Senator Tim Keller and a Resolution was sponsored by Albuquerque City Councilor Rey Garduño. Senator Keller in an interview with the New Mexico Business Weekly stated that:

“The whole international district idea is another step in helping people break down the perceptions that persist about the area and finding ways to celebrate its strengths”.\textsuperscript{45}

Nonetheless, the International District is part of the existing Near Heights Metropolitan Redevelopment Area (MRA) Plan that is currently being expanded. The expansion which is currently under draft expands the original 1,010 acre MRA.\textsuperscript{46} Under the MR Code (3-60A-1:48 NMSA 1978) MRA designation allows municipal acquisition, ownership, lease and improvement of properties within the area to spur economic development. Incentives under the MRA offers private developers impact fee waivers, bonds and improvements financed through tax-increment financing that can possibility further displacement. Money is currently available for such development; Senator Keller secured $1.2 million in capital outlay funds in last year’s Legislature to finance improvements in the district.\textsuperscript{47}


\textsuperscript{46} www.cabq.gov/planning/amra/pdf/draft

Table 6 Analytical Tool: Zuni area

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Stage I</th>
<th>Stage II</th>
<th>Stage III</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>FORMATION</strong></td>
<td><strong>TRANSFORMATION</strong></td>
<td><strong>DISPLACEMENT</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
| 1. Penetration  
  - Visible presence of Mexicanos✓  
  - Common language Spanish✓  
| 4. Individualistic character  
  - Bright color Scheme √  
  - Religious Iconography √  
  - Indigenous referencing √  
  - Spanish signage √  
  Barriology  
  - Murals on neighborhood walls  
    - political___  
    - religious___  
| 3. Government agencies  
  - Resolutions/Ordinances✓  
  - Plans✓  
| 2. Barrioization  
  - Neighborhood Conditions  
  - Cheap rents✓  
  - Crime  
  - Bars on home✓  
  - Graffiti✓  
  - Negative land uses__________  
| 5. Place Making  
  - Spontaneous spaces of gathering  
    - Sidewalks✓  
    - Parks✓  
    - Music✓  
| 4. Private sector  
  - investment✓  
| | 6. Recognition  
  - Commercial activity catering to cultural needs  
  - Carnicerias✓  
  - Street Vendors✓  
  - Money sending services✓  
  - Commercial space serves social function  
  - Information board✓  
  - Sitting area✓ |
III. ANALYSIS: Where is the Zuni area on the three-stage-cycle?

Figure 5.4

Summary:

Albuquerque is a panethnic city where Hispanics of different ethnic backgrounds are fused into one category. Albuquerque’s New Mexican landscape, distinguishable by Pueblo and Territorial style architecture, is altered, however, by the presence of Mexicanos in the city. Analysis of the urban landscape highlights physical distinguishable differences between Mexican spaces and New Mexican spaces.

Thus evaluating the Zuni area in Albuquerque using the three-stage model and drawing on insights from the previous case studies demonstrate that the Zuni area has completed stages I and II of the three-stage-cycle of spatial production. Though the Zuni area has not fully completed the third stage of the cycle, some signs of displacement are surfacing.
Chapter 6

I. Conclusion

Introduction of Resolution R-09-203 is a segue in the transition from the current stage in the cycle to stage III in the Zuni area. The Mexicano cultural identity of the Zuni area is likely to become diluted as revitalization and redevelopment efforts continue in the area. This type of government interference could lead to the displacement of the Mexicano residents in the area. Furthermore, redevelopment practices in the International District have prioritized pan-Asian identity over any other ethnic group within the District’s boundaries. Assertion of Mexicano spaces remains an effort left to the individual commercial spaces like the carnicerias and palaterias in the area.

The Near Heights MRA expansion plan proposes a couple of redevelopment strategies and specific projects that have the potential to transform the area into a “faux” district, like those described on this thesis. Particularly, Redevelopment Strategy 1 of the Near Heights MRA Expansion plan could facilitate in this transition.

Redevelopment Strategy 1 will:

Continue the area’s transformation into an international, multicultural “destination” to attract residents, employees and tourists from all over the city and even beyond. The re-characterization of the surrounding area as the “International District” has been in the works for several years. The idea is to replace the area’s existing depiction as a crime area in the media an on-line with a more positive image.

The plan further explains the implementation of markers that will celebrate the international identity of the Near Heights neighborhood as well as help create a sense of
The plan details the types of markers that can be utilized to achieve this (ie. banners or light poles, informative kiosks or artwork).

Specifics into how this will be accomplished are described in Opportunity Site/Project #2:

*Improvements proposed in this project include a group of streetscape designs and elements along three streets: Gateway, heritage markers, and other design elements at various corner locations would herald and reinforce the entrance to the International District.*

The proposed markings in the International District have the potential to mix pan-Asian and pan-Latino identities into something consumable to outsiders by branding it as international. This effort could further dilute Mexicanindad into the panethnic New Mexican urban landscape chipping away at a sense of place that has been created. These spaces will not be truly Mexican or truly Asian for that matter, they will be carved out for those communities giving them a sense of permission to be ‘exotic’ within the constraints of the boundaries.

Displacement, however, does not have to be inevitable as the three-stage cycle of spatial production shows, and cultural identity does not have to be faux. As outlined in the model brought forth in this thesis, community empowerment can be an outcome in the third. Community engagement in the planning process can be a powerful tool for a community to take control of development efforts.

Policies and plans can either celebrate the Mexicanidad of a place as in the South El Paso case study, or obliterate it through formalization as in the case of El Mercado. Policy recommendations are ways to achieve equitable development.

---

48 See Near Heights MRA Plan, pg 34
49 Also in Near Heights MRA Plan, pg 2
Resolution R-09-316\textsuperscript{50} introduced by City Councilor Rey Garduño in 2009 is an example of how policy can be an effective approach to redevelopment in the International District without displacement. R-03-316 calls for the City to work closely with residents to develop a sector plan that serves the need of the neighborhoods within the International District.

Community participation in the sector planning process is a tool available to help create a true transnational space that maintains Mexicano spatial practices with representations of space that reinforce and embrace it.

**II. Recommendations**

The following are recommendations to aid in maintaining cultural identity and strengthen a sense of belonging in communities that are entering into the final stage of the model:

- **Community engagement component**

  Public participation or involvement in the planning process by those who will be or could be affected by impending development is necessary in order to influence outcomes. Involvement means more than just gathering public input or inviting the community into the table as a gesture of courtesy. In his discussion of the multidimensional public participation model, Alexander (2008) expands on Innes & Brohoer’s (1999) collaborative planning approach where public participation is integrated into the planning process rather than being complementary to the agency [government intervention] leading the proposed development (p. 61). This can take the form of community visioning exercises, design charrettes or taking part in designing the structure of the planning document.

\textsuperscript{50} See City of Albuquerque, Eighteenth Council. Legislation Text File #: R-03-316, Version:2
For the Zuni area collaborative participation could be achieved by:

1. Formation of a task force to guide the planning process and serve as an advisory body
   a. Task Force should include Mexicano residents in the Zuni area

2. Include a cultural preservation element into the structure of the sector plan recommended in R-03-316.
   a. Provide input to the Capital Implementation Program (CIP) through the sector planning process.
      i. Access to open/public space that encourages social interaction and integrates and celebrates cultural identity.
Bibliography


Nieman et al. (1999). What does it mean to be “mexican”? social construction of an ethnic identity. Hispanic Journal of Behavioral Sciences. 21(1).


Phinney, J.S. (1996). ‘When we talk about American ethnic groups, what do we mean?’. American Phycologist. 51(9).


Sanchez, G. (2004). What’s good for boyle heights is good for the jews: creating multiculturalism on the eastside during the 1950’s. American Quarterly. 56(3).


