1-1-1991

Liability and Quality Issues in Health Care

Robert Schwartz  
*University of New Mexico - School of Law, schwartz@law.unm.edu*

Barry R. Furrow

Thomas L. Greaney

Sandra H. Johnson

Timothy Stoltzfus Jost

Follow this and additional works at: [https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facbookdisplay](https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facbookdisplay)  
Part of the [Law Commons](https://digitalrepository.unm.edu/law_facbookdisplay)

**Recommended Citation**

To Donna Jo, Elena, Michael, Nicholas, Eva, Robert and Hayden
B.R.F.

To Nancy, T.J. and Kati
T.L.G.

To Bob, Emily, Kathleen, Colin, Nicholas and Zachary
S.H.J.

To Ruth, Jacob, Micah, and David
T.S.J.

To Jane, Mirra and Elana
R.L.S.

This book is also dedicated to the memory of Nancy Rhoden and Jay Healey, great teachers, wonderful colleagues and warm friends.
Preface

This sixth edition of the paperback, Liability and Quality Issues in Health Care, marks the twentieth anniversary edition of our text, first published in 1987. Since that first edition, no part of the American landscape has changed more than the American health care system. The system has been stressed by demographic changes, buffeted by the winds of political change, and utterly transformed by social and economic developments. The formal structure of the business of health care was a small part of the subject of health law when we published our first edition; it is now the subject of entire graduate programs. The for-profit commercial sector of the health care economy sounded like a lamb twenty years ago; now it roars like a lion. Until a few years ago virtually no one attained elective office because of her position on issues related to health care; now opinion polls peg it as one of the most important issues in the 2008 election. Economic and political fortunes have been made (and lost) predicting the reactions of Americans to changes in our system for delivering health care. While the perspective that we must bring to the legal analysis of health care is far broader now than it was twenty years ago, the fundamental concerns on which that analysis is brought to bear are surprisingly unchanged. As was the case in 1987, we want to know what role the law might play in promoting the quality of health care but now in 2008 the problem of medical error and poor quality has finally moved to the forefront of regulatory and consumer concerns in the American system.

This paperback sixth edition continues to employ materials from a variety of sources. It contains the most significant and useful judicial opinions dealing with the issues of quality and liability in health law, drawn from the federal and state courts. The book also contains statutes, legislative history, administrative regulations, excerpts from contracts, consent forms, and a host of other kinds of materials designed to bring the subject of health law to life in the classroom. It also contains many classroom-tested problems that should be helpful in encouraging reflections on these materials. While many of the problems and other materials have been brought forward from earlier editions of this book, every section has been rewritten and the organization of the text reflects new developments in American health care. All cases, statutes, regulations, and other materials in the casebook have been edited to enhance their teaching value while assuring that they reflect problems faced by health lawyers coping with the health system in 2008 and beyond. The notes expose students to a range of the most subtle health law inquiries under discussion at the time of publication.

This paperback provides a detailed teaching tool for both the doctrinal underpinnings and the litigation issues for professional liability cases; it also looks at the new caselaw and regulatory initiatives that are bubbling up across the country. Chapter 1, the introduction, provides some benchmarks against which we can measure other developments in health care. It addresses how we define illness and health, how we assess quality within the health care system.
including how we address medical error, how we establish the foundation for good health and the prevention of disease, and how we might fairly distribute health care within our society. The next five chapters (chapters 2 through 6) address ways in which the law can contribute to the promotion of the quality of health care. This part of the casebook includes thorough treatment of governmental efforts to assure the quality of health care services, including the interaction between public and private quality initiatives, as well as extensive analysis of medical malpractice law. Chapter 6 now contains a section of managed care liability, following directly from the section on institutional liability, and ends with a brief discussion of malpractice reform.

Chapter 7 then addresses the issues of access to health care and the movement from common law litigation to EMTALA and the ADA and Title VI as tools to expand access to health care. Chapter 8 looks at the role of insurance and the nature of managed care quality regulation. Chapter 9 addresses the federal role in regulating managed care, with an extensive look at ERISA and the Supreme Court’s latest rulings, particularly Davila. The continued evolution of managed care is examined, as is the emergence of the consumer-driven health care movement. This material also addresses legal obligations to provide medical services, and examines legal and policy issues in health care disparities.

This book is designed to be a teachable book. We are grateful for the many comments and helpful suggestions that health law teachers across the United States (and from elsewhere, too) have made to help us improve this new edition. We attempt to present all sides of policy issues, not to evangelize for any political, economic or social agenda of our own. This task is made easier, undoubtedly, by the diverse views on virtually all policy issues that the several different authors of this casebook bring to this endeavor. A large number of very well respected health law teachers have contributed a great deal to this and previous editions by making suggestions, reviewing problems, or encouraging our more thorough investigation of a wide range of health law subjects. We are especially grateful to Charles Baron, Eugene Basanta, David Bennahum, Robert Berenson, Kathleen Boozang, Arnold Celnicker, Don Chalmers, Ellen Wright Clayton, Judith Daar, Dena Davis, Kelly Dineen, Ileana Dominguez-Urban, Stewart Duban, Margaret Farrell, David Frankford, Michael Gerhart, Joan McIver Gibson, Susan Goldberg, Jesse Goldner, Andrew Grubb, Art LaFrance, Diane Hoffmann, Jill Horwitz, Amy Jaeger, Eleanor Kinney, Thomasine Kusher, Pam Lambert, Theodore LeBlang, Antoinette Sedillo Lopez, Lawrence Singer, Joan Krause, Leslie Mansfield, Thomas Mayo, Maxwell Mehlman, Alan Meisel, Vicki Michel, Frances Miller, John Munich, David Orentlicher, Vernelia Randall, Ben Rich, Arnold Rosoff, Karen Rothenberg, Mark Rothstein, Sallie Sanford, Giles Scofield, Jeff Sconyers, Charity Scott, Ross Silverman, Loane Skene, George Smith, Sheila Taub, Michael Vitiello, Sidney Watson, Ellen Wertheimer, William Winslade and Susan M. Wolf for the benefit of their wisdom and experience.

We wish to thank those who provided support for our research and the preparation of the manuscript, including the Frances Lewis Law Center, the Robert L. Willett family, Carrie Snow, Vera Mencer, John Moore, Patrick Pedano, Yamini Laks, Mukta Agrawal, Maryellen Guinan, Ann Marter, and Andrew Rusczek, Ann Marie Binns, Laura Spencer, Melanie Rankin, Katie
Fink, Erik Lawson, Micah Jost, and Andrew Fairfield. We all have special appreciation for the exceptional work done by Mary Ann Jauer at St. Louis University, and for the tremendous publication assistance provided by Pamela Siege, Roxanne Birkel, and Louis Higgins at Thomson West. Finally, we wish to thank our deans, Roger Dennis, Jeffrey E. Lewis, Suellen Scarnecchia, and Rodney Smolla, and Department Chair Dr. James DuBois.

It has been a splendid opportunity to work on the twentieth anniversary editions of our health law casebooks and paperbacks. It has been a constant challenge to find a way to teach cutting edge issues influencing our health care system—at times before the courts or legislatures have given us much legal material for our casebook. Each time we have done a new edition, there have been developments that we find difficult to assess as to whether they will become more significant during the lifespan of the edition or are simply blips. It is always difficult to delete materials that required much labor and still remain quite relevant but that have been eclipsed in importance by others, and the length of each succeeding edition attests to our challenge. Finally, we don’t write this casebook for our classes alone, but rather for yours as well. We enjoy teaching, and we hope that comes through to the students and teachers who use this book.

A note on editorial style: Ellipses in the text of the quoted material indicate an omission of material within the quoted paragraph. Centered ellipses indicate the omission of a paragraph or more; the first line following centered ellipses may not be the first line of the next paragraph, and the last line preceding centered ellipses may not be the last line of the preceding paragraph. Brackets indicate the omission of a citation without the omission of other materials. There is no acknowledgment of omitted footnotes. To the extent it is possible, the style of this casebook is consistent with the principle that legal writing form should follow function, and the function of this text is to help students understand health law.

BARRY R. FURROW
THOMAS L. GREANEY
SANDRA H. JOHNSON
TIMOTHY S. JOST
ROBERT L. SCHWARTZ

June 2008
Acknowledgements


Summary of Contents

Page

Preface v
Acknowledgements ix
Table of Cases xxi

Chapter 1. Introduction to Health Law and Policy 1
   I. Defining Sickness 1
   II. Quality in Health Care 15
   III. The Problem of Medical Error 41

Chapter 2. Quality Control Regulation: Licensing of Health Care Professionals 72
   I. Discipline 74
   II. Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM) 88
   III. Unlicensed Providers 97
   IV. Scope of Practice Regulation 107

Chapter 3. Quality Control Regulation of Health Care Institutions 116
   I. New Health Care Service Configurations 117
   II. Regulatory Systems 120
   III. Private Accreditation of Health Care Facilities 148

Chapter 4. The Professional–Patient Relationship 152
   I. The Contract Between Patient and Physician 158
   II. Informed Consent: The Physician’s Obligation 187
   III. Informed Consent: The Institution’s Obligation? 243
   IV. Confidentiality and Disclosure in the Physician–Patient Relationship 246

Chapter 5. Liability of Health Care Professionals 284
   I. The Standard of Care 284
   II. Judicial Standard Setting 314
   III. Other Theories 320
   IV. Defenses to a Malpractice Suit 338
   V. Causation Problems 378
   VI. Damage Innovations 382

Chapter 6. Liability of Health Care Institutions 394
   I. Agency Law and the Test of “Control” 395
   II. Independent Contractors and Vicarious Liability 402
   III. Hospital Direct Liability 413
   IV. Tort Liability of Managed Care 461
V. Reforming the Tort System for Medical Injuries.................................................................. 496

Chapter 7. Access to Health Care: The Obligation to Provide Care........................................ 517
  I. Common Law Approaches................................................................................................. 521
  II. Statutory Exceptions to the Common Law...................................................................... 530

Chapter 8. Private Health Insurance and Managed Care: State Regulation and Liability......... 559
  I. Insurance and Managed Care: Some Basic Concepts....................................................... 559
  II. Contract Liability of Private Insurers and Managed Care Organizations......................... 569
  III. Tort Liability of Managed Care....................................................................................... 574
  IV. Regulation of Private Health Insurance Under State Law.............................................. 574
  V. State Regulation of Managed Care................................................................................... 581
  VI. Perspectives on Managed Care Regulation and Insurance Coverage Mandates.............. 599
  VII. What Follows Managed Care? Consumer–Directed Health Care................................. 603

Chapter 9. Regulation of Insurance and Managed Care: The Federal Role............................. 609
  I. Introduction....................................................................................................................... 609
  II. The Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA).................................. 610

INDEX........................................................................................................................................ 671
# Table of Contents

| PREFACE | v |
| ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS | ix |
| TABLE OF CASES | xxi |

## Chapter 1. Introduction to Health Law and Policy

I. Defining Sickness

- *Katskee v. Blue Cross/Blue Shield of Nebraska* .................................................. 3
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 9

- *Problem: The Couple's Illness* ........................................................................................................... 10
- *Alain Enthoven, Ph.D., What Medical Care Is and Isn't* .............................................................. 10
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 15

II. Quality in Health Care

- *A. Defining the Nature of Quality in Health Care* ................................................................. 15
- *Avedis Donabedian, The Definition of Quality and Approaches to Its Assessment* .............. 15
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 16

- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 20

- *B. Assessing Quality* .................................................................................................................... 21
  1. Structure, Process and Outcome Measures of Quality ............................................................. 21
- *Avedis Donabedian, The Definition of Quality and Approaches to Its Assessment* .............. 21
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 23

  2. Medical Practice Variation and the Nature of Quality in Medicine ........................................... 26
- *Berry v. Cardiology Consultants, P.A.* ......................................................................................... 28
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 33

  3. Clinical Standards of Practice .................................................................................................... 35
- *Timothy S. Jost, Oversight of the Quality of Medical Care: Regulation, Management, or the Market?* ........................................................................................................................................... 35
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 36

  4. Electronic Medical Records ......................................................................................................... 37

III. The Problem of Medical Error

- *A. Medical Iatrogenesis: Definitions and Extent* ........................................................................ 41

- *B. The Extent of Medical Misadventures* ..................................................................................... 41
- *Patients, Doctors, and Lawyers: Medical Injury, Malpractice Litigation, and Patient Compensation in New York* ................................................................................................................................. 41
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 43

- *C. Strategies for Reducing Medical Errors* ................................................................................... 45
- *Lucian L. Leape, Error in Medicine* ............................................................................................. 45
- *To Err Is Human: Building a Safer Health System* ...................................................................... 53
- *Notes and Questions* ...................................................................................................................... 55
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Chapter 2. Quality Control Regulation: Licensing of Health Care Professionals

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>I. Discipline</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In re Williams</td>
<td>74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Hoover v. The Agency for Health Care Administration</td>
<td>77</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: State and Federal Regulation of Prescribing Practices</td>
<td>79</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>82</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: Three Strikes and You’re Out?</td>
<td>85</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Note: State Medical Boards and Telemedicine</td>
<td>87</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Complementary and Alternative Medicine (CAM)</td>
<td>88</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Board of Registration for the Healing Arts v. McDonagh</td>
<td>89</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>95</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III. Unlicensed Providers</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: Making Room for Alternative Practitioners</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>State Board of Nursing and State Board of Healing Arts v. Ruebke</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV. Scope of Practice Regulation</td>
<td>107</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sermchief v. Gonzales</td>
<td>108</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>111</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: Physicians, Physician Assistants, and Nurses</td>
<td>113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: Retail Clinics</td>
<td>115</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

## Chapter 3. Quality Control Regulation of Health Care Institutions

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>116</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. New Health Care Service Configurations</td>
<td>117</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mauceri v. Chassin</td>
<td>118</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: To Regulate or Not to Regulate? That is the Question</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II. Regulatory Systems</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Differences Between Hospitals and Nursing Homes</td>
<td>120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Nursing Homes: Licensure and Medicare/Medicaid</td>
<td>124</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Regulatory Process</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Standard Setting</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>In re the Estate of Michael Patrick Smith v. Heckler</td>
<td>126</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
II. Regulatory Systems—Continued
Notes and Questions .................................................. 130
Problem: Setting Standards for Staffing .......................... 133
Problem: Residents’ Rights ............................................ 133
2. Survey and Inspection .............................................. 138
3. Sanctions ............................................................... 139
Fairfax Nursing Home, Inc. v. U.S. Dept of Health & Human
Services ...................................................................... 139
Notes and Questions .................................................. 142
Problem: Restful Manor ................................................. 145
III. Private Accreditation of Health Care Facilities .......... 148

Chapter 4. The Professional–Patient Relationship .......... 152

Introduction ............................................................... 152
Esquiuel v. Watters ...................................................... 152
Notes and Questions .................................................. 156
I. The Contract Between Patient and Physician ............. 158
A. Physicians in Institutions ......................................... 160
Millard v. Corrado ...................................................... 160
Notes and Questions .................................................. 167
B. Specific Promises and Warranties of Cure .................. 169
Mills v. Pate ............................................................. 169
Notes and Questions .................................................. 174
C. Exculpatory Clauses .................................................. 176
Tunki v. Regents of Univ. of California ......................... 176
Notes and Questions .................................................. 178
D. Partial Limitations on the Right to Sue ...................... 179
1. Protecting Deeply Held Religious or Other Beliefs ...... 179
   Shorter v. Drury ...................................................... 179
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 183
   Problem: Arbitrating Disaster .................................. 185
   Problem: Mediating Disaster .................................... 185
2. Protecting Patient Choices About Health Care Costs: Con-
   sumer–Directed Health Plans ..................................... 186
   Problem: Life Foregone ............................................ 187
II. Informed Consent: The Physician’s Obligation .......... 187
B. The Legal Framework of Informed Consent ............... 190
   1. Negligence as a Basis for Recovery ....................... 190
      Canterbury v. Spence ........................................... 190
      Notes and Questions .......................................... 197
      Note: Decision Aids and Informed Consent ............. 202
   2. Disclosure of Physician—Specific Risk Information .... 203
      Johnson v. Kokemoor .......................................... 203
      Notes and Questions .......................................... 211
      Problem: Disclosing Physician Risks ...................... 215
      Arato v. Avedon ................................................... 215
      Notes and Questions .......................................... 222
      Problem: Information Overload ............................. 224
   4. Disclosure of Physician Conflicts of Interest .......... 225
      Moore v. Regents of the University of California ....... 225
      Notes and Questions .......................................... 230
C. Causation Complexities ............................................ 234
   Canterbury v. Spence ............................................. 234
   Notes and Questions .............................................. 235
# Chapter 5. Liability of Health Care Professionals

## I. The Standard of Care

A. Establishing the Standard of Care
   - *Hall v. Hilbun*
   - Notes and Questions
   - Note: Expert Testimony in Professional Liability Cases

B. Practice Guidelines as Codified Standards of Care
   - *Hinlicky v. Dreyfuss*
   - Notes and Questions

C. Other Methods of Proving Negligence
   - Problem: Evidentiary Hurdles

## II. Judicial Standard Setting

- *Helling v. Carey*
- Notes and Questions
- Note: The Effects of Tort Suits on Provider Behavior

## III. Other Theories

A. Negligent Infliction of Mental Distress
   - Notes and Questions

B. Duties to Contest Reimbursement Limits
   - *Wickline v. State*
   - Notes and Questions
   - Problem: The Hospital Revolving Door

## IV. Defenses to a Malpractice Suit

A. Standard of Care Exceptions
   - *Chamber v. McClure*
   - Notes and Questions
   - Problem: To Monitor or Not?

B. Clinical Innovation
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter 6. Liability of Health Care Institutions</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>IV. Defenses to a Malpractice Suit—Continued</strong></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Procedure Innovations</td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Brook v. St. John's Hickey Memorial Hospital</em></td>
<td>343</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>344</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Drug Therapy Innovations</td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Richardson v. Miller</em></td>
<td>347</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>350</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Affirmative Defenses</td>
<td>361</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. Statute of Limitations</td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Hardi v. Mezzanotte</em></td>
<td>362</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>366</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Good Samaritan Acts</td>
<td>367</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. Contributory Fault of the Patient</td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ostrowski v. Azzara</em></td>
<td>369</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>375</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Problem: The Difficult Patient</em></td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V. Causation Problems</td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Robins v. Garg</em></td>
<td>378</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>380</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI. Damage Innovations</td>
<td>382</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. The “Loss of a Chance” Doctrine</td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Herskovits v. Group Health Cooperative of Puget Sound</em></td>
<td>383</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>389</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Problem: The Patient’s Choice?</em></td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Punitive Damages</td>
<td>392</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Chapter 6. Liability of Health Care Institutions</strong></td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Introduction</strong></td>
<td>394</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I. Agency Law and the Test of “Control”</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Employees</td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Grimm v. Summit County Children Services Board</em></td>
<td>395</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. The Medical Staff and Hospital Governance</td>
<td>397</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Scott v. SSM Healthcare St. Louis</em></td>
<td>398</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>401</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>II. Independent Contractors and Vicarious Liability</strong></td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Burless v. West Virginia University Hospitals, Inc.</em></td>
<td>402</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>408</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Problem: Creating a Shield</em></td>
<td>412</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>III. Hospital Direct Liability</strong></td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. Negligence</td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Washington v. Washington Hospital Center</em></td>
<td>413</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>417</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. Duties to Treat Patients</td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Muse v. Charter Hospital of Winston–Salem, Inc.</em></td>
<td>419</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>422</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. Corporate Negligence</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1. The Elements of Corporate Negligence</td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Darling v. Charleston Community Memorial Hospital</em></td>
<td>423</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>425</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Thompson v. Nason Hosp.</em></td>
<td>427</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>431</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Negligent Credentialing</td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Carter v. Hucks–Folliss</em></td>
<td>433</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>434</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### III. Hospital Direct Liability—Continued

**Problem: Cascading Errors** ............................................................ 437

3. Peer Review Immunity and Corporate Negligence .......................... 438
   *Larson v. Wasemiller* ......................................................... 438
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 451
   **Problem: Proctoring Peers** .............................................. 455
   **Problem: The “Love” Surgeon** ........................................... 455
   *Kadlec Medical Center v. Lakeview Anesthesia Associates* .......... 456
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 458
   **Problem: Referrals** .......................................................... 460
   **Problem: The Birthing Center** .......................................... 460

### IV. Tort Liability of Managed Care ............................................. 461

A. Vicarious Liability ..................................................................... 462
   *Petrovich v. Share Health Plan of Illinois, Inc.* ....................... 462
   *Pagarigan v. Aetna U.S. Healthcare of California, Inc.* ............. 473
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 481

B. Direct Institutional Liability: Corporate Negligence .................. 484
   *Shannon v. McNulty* ............................................................. 484
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 488

C. Physician Incentive Systems .................................................... 489
   *Brannan v. Northwest Permanente, P.C.* .................................. 489
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 491
   **Problem: The Overworked HMO Physician** ............................. 494
   **Problem: Wanting the “Best”** .......................................... 495

### V. Reforming the Tort System for Medical Injuries ..................... 496

A. Medical Progress and Other Changes in the Health Care Environment ................................................................................. 497

B. The Nature of the Insurance Industry ...................................... 498
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 500

C. Improving Insurance Availability ............................................ 503

D. Altering the Litigation Process ............................................... 504

E. Alternative Approaches to Compensation of Patient Injury ........ 506
   1. Alternative Dispute Resolution (ADR) .................................... 506
   2. No-Fault Systems .................................................................. 507
      a. Provider-Based Early Payment ........................................ 507
         *Notes and Questions* ....................................................... 507
      b. Administrative Systems .................................................. 508
         *Notes and Questions* ....................................................... 508

F. Conclusion .................................................................................. 509
   **Problem: National Medical Error Disclosure and Compensation Act** .......................................................... 509

### Chapter 7. Access to Health Care: The Obligation to Provide Care ................................................................................. 517

**Introduction** ................................................................................ 517

I. Common Law Approaches ......................................................... 521
   *Ricks v. Budge* ....................................................................... 521
   *Childs v. Weis* ....................................................................... 524
   *Williams v. U.S.* ..................................................................... 525
   *Notes and Questions* ........................................................... 527
   **Problem: Cheryl Hanachek** ................................................. 528
   **Problem: Ethics and Law: Never the Twain Shall Meet?** ........ 529

II. Statutory Exceptions to the Common Law .................................. 530

A. EMTALA ..................................................................................... 530
   *Emergency Medical Treatment and Labor Act* ......................... 531
   *Baber v. Hospital Corporation of America* .............................. 534
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Chapter</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Statutory Exceptions to the Common Law—Continued</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>539</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Mrs. Miller</td>
<td>543</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>The Americans With Disabilities Act and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Bragdon v. Abbott</td>
<td>544</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>549</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Howe v. Hull</td>
<td>550</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>553</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Title VI</td>
<td>554</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Emmaus House</td>
<td>557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: What Kind of Care?</td>
<td>557</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td><strong>Chapter 8. Private Health Insurance and Managed Care: State Regulation and Liability</strong></td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>I.</td>
<td>Insurance and Managed Care: Some Basic Concepts</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>The Concept of Managed Care</td>
<td>559</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Jacob S. Hacker and Theodore R. Marmor, How Not to Think About “Managed Care”</td>
<td>561</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Note</td>
<td>563</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>The Concept of Insurance</td>
<td>564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Congressional Research Service, Insuring the Uninsured: Options and Analysis</td>
<td>565</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Deborah Stone, The Struggle for the Soul of Health Insurance</td>
<td>568</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>II.</td>
<td>Contract Liability of Private Insurers and Managed Care Organizations</td>
<td>569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Lubeznik v. Healthchicago, Inc.</td>
<td>569</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>572</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>III.</td>
<td>Tort Liability of Managed Care</td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>IV.</td>
<td>Regulation of Private Health Insurance Under State Law</td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Traditional Insurance Regulation</td>
<td>574</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>Attempts to Increase Access to Insurance Through Regulation</td>
<td>575</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Colonial Life Insurance Company of America v. Curiale</td>
<td>576</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>578</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Expanding Insurance Coverage</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>V.</td>
<td>State Regulation of Managed Care</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.</td>
<td>Introduction</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Massachusetts General Laws Annotated: An Act Relative to Managed Care Practices in the Insurance Industry</td>
<td>581</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>590</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problems: Advising Under State Managed Care Law</td>
<td>591</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B.</td>
<td>State Law Regulating MCO Networks</td>
<td>592</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C.</td>
<td>Utilization Controls</td>
<td>593</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D.</td>
<td>Provider Incentives</td>
<td>596</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E.</td>
<td>Quality Regulation</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problem: Regulating Managed Care</td>
<td>598</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VI.</td>
<td>Perspectives on Managed Care Regulation and Insurance Coverage Mandates</td>
<td>599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>George J. Annas, A National Bill of Patients’ Rights</td>
<td>599</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>David Hyman, Regulating Managed Care: What’s Wrong With a Patient Bill of Rights</td>
<td>600</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>601</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>VII.</td>
<td>What Follows Managed Care? Consumer–Directed Health Care</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Timothy S. Jost and Mark A. Hall, The Role of State Regulation in Consumer–Driven Health Care</td>
<td>603</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Problems: Consumer–Driven Health Care</td>
<td>607</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

## Chapter 9. Regulation of Insurance and Managed Care: The Federal Role

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>I. Introduction</th>
<th>609</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>II. The Employee Retirement Income Security Act of 1974 (ERISA)</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A. ERISA Preemption of State Health Insurance Regulation</td>
<td>610</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Rush Prudential HMO, Inc. v. Debra C. Moran, Et al.</em></td>
<td>611</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>619</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: ERISA Preemption of State Managed Care Regulation</td>
<td>624</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>B. ERISA Preemption and State Health Care Reform</td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Retail Industry Leaders Association v. Fiedler</em></td>
<td>625</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>630</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>C. The Relationship Between Federal ERISA Fiduciary Law and State Tort Claims Against Managed Care Plans</td>
<td>631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Pegram v. Herdrich</em></td>
<td>631</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>640</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>D. ERISA Preemption of State Tort Litigation</td>
<td>642</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Aetna Health Inc. v. Davila</em></td>
<td>643</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>651</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>E. Beneficiary Remedies Provided by ERISA</td>
<td>655</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Doe v. Group Hospitalization &amp; Medical Services</em></td>
<td>656</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>661</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Problem: ERISA Litigation</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>F. Administrative Claims and Appeals Procedures Under ERISA</td>
<td>667</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Notes and Questions</td>
<td>669</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

INDEX | 671 |